

Thursday, November 30, 2017

**ITEM 1: CALL TO ORDER:**

Mayor Flaute called the Riverside, Ohio, City Council Special Meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. at the Riverside Administrative Offices located at 5200 Springfield Street, Suite 100, Riverside, Ohio, 45431.

**ITEM 2: PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Mayor Flaute.

**ITEM 3: ROLL CALL:**

Council attendance was as follows: Deputy Mayor Curp, present; Mr. Denning, present; Mr. Fullenkamp, present; Mrs. Lommatzsch, present; Mrs. Reynolds, present; Deputy Mayor Smith, absent; and Mayor Flaute, present.

Staff present was as follows: Mark Carpenter, City Manager; Chris Lohr; Assistant City Manager; Tom Garrett, Finance Director; Brock Taylor, Planning and Program Management Director; Frank Robinson, Police Chief; Daniel Stitzel, Fire Chief; Jay Keaton, Public Service Manager; and Brenna Arnold, Clerk of Council.

**ITEM 4: EXCUSE ABSENT MEMBERS:**

A motion was made by Mrs. Reynolds to excuse Mr. Smith. Mrs. Lommatzsch seconded the motion.

There was no discussion on the motion.

All were in favor; none opposed. **Motion carried.**

Mr. Smith arrived at 6:32 p.m.

**ITEM 5: ADDITIONS OR CORRECTIONS TO AGENDA:**

The agenda was revised prior to the start of the meeting.

**ITEM 6: APPROVAL OF AGENDA:**

A motion was made by Mrs. Reynolds to approve the revised agenda as submitted. Mr. Denning seconded the motion.

There was no discussion on the motion.

All were in favor; none opposed. **Motion carried.**

**ITEM 7: PRESENTATIONS**

Mr. Carpenter: First up tonight will be the Police Department, then we will go down the line and discuss the capital items and address any other questions you may have from the budget you have received.

A) 2018 Budget – Police Department

Chief Robinson: Good evening. I just want you to take a look at that slide and see if you have any questions about 2017 and the future in 2018. I have a couple of questions myself actually. That \$41,000.00 up there, I'm not sure about that one. Mr. Carpenter: It's just an estimate. Mr. Garrett: Health insurance. Chief Robinson: That's a big estimate. Mr. Carpenter: That's for sure. Chief Robinson: We hope that does not happen. Mayor Flaute: So it looks like we are spending and the forecast will be under \$2 million. You budgeted \$2,150,000.00. Is there any particular reason why or are you going to explain that? Chief Robinson: On what did we budget that, wages? Mayor Flaute: On salaries and wages. Mrs. Lommatzsch: The top line. Chief Robinson: That's just based on the contract and the increases in the contract

Thursday, November 30, 2017

for next year if we actually have them. Am I correct in that response? Mr. Carpenter: You are referring to the budgeted 2017, is that right? We had some vacancies in the Police Department that contributed to the forecast being less than what we appropriated. Mayor Flaute: Got it. Chief Robinson: Are there any other questions about that?

Obviously I would like to stand up here and ask you for to give me about 10 more Policemen or ladies and obviously that is not going to happen. Understanding that I do feel the need that we need to actually step forward, we have a lot of things that I need. I need five to be honest with you; to be able to afford five is probably not going to happen, so I am going to stand up here and ask you for one new full-time position. That is a Patrol Officer and would mostly be dedicated to a community service type position. Obviously they would deal with the direct needs of the citizens, all the calls and complaints and things like they, they would handle all of those, crime prevention, crime analysis and everything we use our new mapping system for, any of the extracurricular activities that they are going to do on the weekends or during the week they would obviously be available to go to those and their schedule will be made around those type of events so we can make sure to have at least one person there.

Obviously this year we tried to make a very conscientious effort to have a lot of Police Officers at a lot of different events in the City and there is a lot of time and preparation and this person can take on that responsibility as well. They still would be a Police Officer as well like any other Police Officer, so if we had to have them work the street they can. Obviously if you look at my slide you will see what our idea would be is to bring someone in the Police Department to move to that position and then offset that by hiring a new Officer which will be as a currently contracted new hire. Added in the events, we thought that person would go to at least an average of 50 events during the year and plan those as well, so they would be involved in a lot of things on a daily basis. In a former life of mine, we had this Officer and I have to be honest with you it was great to have that person be able to do all those events for us and set those things up. That's my pitch for one Police Officer and that's the position I would want them to fill.

A part-time Administrative Assistant, I think we are probably the only Police Department around here that only has one person that actually works in the building that does administrative work. She does multiple things within the job functions. She probably has and I think we did some looking at it. I think it is the next slide that is going to show you what this one person does for the Police Department just on average monthly basis. However the problem here runs into the fact that we don't have anybody to take her place if in fact she has an illness or she has two kids that could be ill or she has vacation or anything like that. We don't have anybody come in and take her place that can actually answer the window, answer the calls, get them to the right places they need to go to, and all those things other than her. Unless we want to bring a Policeman in or bring some in from back in the property room and bring Danny from the property room to be at the window. That takes him away from doing his job. We surely do not want to pay a Policeman to come in there and sit at that window because we are talking a lot more money on the hour to do something like that and come in to do that.

There are a lot of functions that this person does as you can see on this list, I know it is kind of small and I apologize for that. This is just an average of what she does in the Police Department and this is just what she has been writing down, these aren't the times when she is being asked by different people to come into the office to fix their computer because she is better at it than anybody else; it's just the way it is. She helps other departments as well. Jay can testify to that. She helps him quite a bit when he needs some assistance as well, however like I said that's only one person. There is no other city around here that has one administrative person at their Police Department, I guarantee you. Trotwood has about four, so we are running short every day and we don't have anybody to take her place ever. She can't go away from the window, otherwise there is nobody there and we have to call someone else to take them away from their job to go do hers. It is kind of hard for us to do that. I just gave you an estimation of how much it would cost for us to have one. There is a need for it, absolutely. That's my pitch for my one Administrative Assistant. You

Thursday, November 30, 2017

can look over these numbers. If you have any questions, please ask me because these are all legitimate numbers. Months ago I had our Records Clerk / Administrative Assistant write down all the things that she does every day and this is how this started and we started realizing how much stuff she actually does. For one person, this is a lot of things.

Mrs. Reynolds: Chief this will probably be for you and the City Manager, are both of these positions accounted for in this budget page? Mr. Carpenter: No. Mrs. Reynolds: So it is an addition? Mr. Carpenter: Yes. Mrs. Reynolds: Okay. That's what I needed to know. Thank you. Looking at the property room personnel, they can't pick up any of the slack here? Chief Robinson: Well he does whenever we have the need for it; he does come up and work the window, however then he can't do his job back there and if you have seen the property room now you will see that there is a huge difference in the way we do business and the way it looks and it takes a long time for him to get all of that stuff done. He can pick up some of the slack; it is just very difficult because it is taking him away from it.

Mrs. Reynolds: You said the cost on the full-time Police Officer would be set by contract for a new hire. Can you give us an estimate of what that cost will be? Chief Robinson: Mr. Garrett, can you help me with that? Mr. Garrett: Well, let's do a little math. The wage is \$53,270, of course that is the current rate so next year it would be a little bit higher because of the contract change and then you have to add on the insurance and benefits. Mrs. Reynolds: So we are looking at 25% of that? Mr. Garrett: About 1/3 of that probably. Mrs. Reynolds: 30%? Mayor Flaute: \$83,000.00 for a starting Officer. Mrs. Reynolds: Thank you. Chief Robinson: Yes, ma'am.

Mr. Fullenkamp: I have a question. This is directed at the City Manager. I thought this idea of an administrative pool was meant to address some of these issues. Is that not an option? Mr. Carpenter: Earlier this year we did have someone sit over there at the Police for I think it was a week, but the challenge is to learn all the tasks and be consistent with the court paperwork and the tickets and all of that other than sitting at the window. It make is much more difficult. The person can take phone calls and can direct questions, but to do some of the other work consistently becomes a challenge. Mr. Fullenkamp: So we have had no cross training of our administrative staff? Mr. Carpenter: Not to any length, no. We have our challenges over here in this building. Mr. Fullenkamp: Thanks.

Mr. Denning: So the idea of an administrative pool is great in theory, but doesn't really work because of the specific tasks that each department has that are different? Mr. Carpenter: That's what we are finding. It hasn't worked as we thought it was going to work. Mr. Denning: Okay. Mr. Fullenkamp: Can I add onto that because I'm not sure, is any training occurring to cross train people into different tasks or is it more a lack of training? Mr. Carpenter: We have tried to use Dawn over there in the Maintenance Department to train her on the admin side of things and it hasn't gone very well. We have people over here in this building that have filled in somewhat, but not to a great degree. For example, we know Pam has been out for a while, so Anne and Elayna will work the front desk for part of the day until Becky comes in, they come back and do their work or if Anne was out it would be picked up a little bit by the folks at the front desk. Mr. Fullenkamp: But are these people trained to do these various jobs and do you have a training process in place at all? Mr. Carpenter: No. Mr. Fullenkamp: That could be part of the reason that this system isn't working out so well. Mr. Carpenter: It could be.

Mrs. Reynolds: Looking at this list of tasks, I don't know that anything on here would be hard to bring over to your administrative staff in this building. We are talking court paperwork, I'm assuming that is typing the court paperwork up and submitting it. Chief Robinson: Right. All the paperwork comes in from the guys on the road. It comes in to a big pile if you will especially on Mondays there is a lot. Then you have to go through there and make copies of everything and get the court paperwork itself that has to have a copy of those things and then you have to ship them over to the court. It has to be done by 9:00 a.m. Mrs. Reynolds: Okay. I'm not understanding everything that you have on this list, Chief; distribute mail, answer/make calls, order

Thursday, November 30, 2017

supplies, restock road room forms. Background checks, what does the Assistant do in background checks? Chief Robinson: She does all the ones for the alcohol permits and all those things through the computer and DIBERS and she has access to that. Mrs. Reynolds: I don't know so I am just asking this question, but isn't there information on the background checks. Is she authorized to deal with those things? Chief Robinson: She has taken the test just like the Police Officer has to take that test to use the LEADS term and all that. She has taken all of those. She doesn't have the exact privileges that a Police Officer would have. She has associated privileges I guess you would call it or limited privileges that she can do those things.

Mrs. Reynolds: And records requests, I thought our Clerk was handling the records requests. Those are two big time items, that's what I'm looking at. Chief Robinson: Right. She does records requests there, so I guess they go together and do these things. I'm not sure exactly how that works. Ms. Arnold: I don't have access to police reports and crash reports and all of that, so she keeps the record of them and we have talked about retention and all of that stuff with those. She will box them up at the end of the year. At one point she and I were working together on those and there was a lot of back and forth and it was taking twice as long for her to do what she needed to do and then I would have to make a copy what she's already done. Nine times out of 10 someone will go to the Police Department to request a crash report because that's where you would normally go, so for her to say hold on let me email that to Brenna and then you can go pick it up from her over at our office just wasn't efficient and wasn't benefitting the residents at all. Those type of things she does still handle and then if it is outside of that like a personnel file or what have you Chris and I work together to get all of that sorted out. Chief Robinson: I guess there is a connection between you two and how you do the alcohol permits and stuff like that. They work together on that. Ms. Arnold: We communicate pretty well.

Mrs. Reynolds: What is the typed property room letters? Is that something we can move to the Property Room Clerk? I'm trying to help you out Chief. Come on. Chief Robinson: We could, but here is the thing those can sometimes run into hundreds of letters and what happens is he is just not going to be as proficient as she is going to be at doing it. Those are the letters that we send out to people to advise them that we have their property or monies or anything like that. We send those out to them so they can get back with us in 30 days and if they don't respond back then obviously we can do what we need to do with the property. That's what those letters are. Mrs. Reynolds: Tell Danny to take a typing class. Chief Robinson: He would do it, but it would look something like that one finger thing. Mrs. Reynolds: And he would do it well. Chief Robinson: Understanding that this too there are just a lot of things for her to do. The problem that we are really going to run into is we won't have anybody to back her up at all and I really don't think we have the personnel even at this building to send someone down on a daily basis to go down there and assist us at the PD. That is going to be cumbersome at best, so what is happening is we are teaching some of our Policemen to do some of these things to be honest with you. There is a need still.

Mrs. Lommatzsch: My concern is what you are going to pay and what is going to be the stability of someone staying in that job. We take time and effort and money to train somebody at that level and that pay scale. There could be the perfect person out there, don't get me wrong. Chief Robinson: I know it is tough. Mrs. Lommatzsch: Yeah. Chief Robinson: We have one currently working in the City and she works at the front desk. Just saying. Mr. Denning: There are people that want just part time work. Mrs. Lommatzsch: I am a part-time worker, I understand that. Chief Robinson: You're hired. Mayor Flaute: Maybe we could have a full-time person that could do this and do Becky's job rather than have two part-time people. Mrs. Lommatzsch: No, I'm just concerned about getting somebody trained to do this job and what the longevity of them staying would be. It is going to take training to learn to do all of those administrative tasks and to do them right and keep us out of trouble. The Police Department is an important part of our function and we don't want it to get messed up, so that is my concern is whether we can even hire somebody at that rate. Like I said, there may be the perfect person out there, but we are going to have to be careful who we hire. Chief Robinson: I agree.

Thursday, November 30, 2017

Mr. Fullenkamp: I'm going to address this to the City Manager, are we sure our administrative pool has got plenty of work to do? Are we sure we can't train one of our administrative pool to do this fill in job? Mr. Carpenter: Like I said earlier, we had someone over there for like a week. The problem is being proficient and learning to do it. As an emergency fill in, yeah we can cover it temporarily, but to be proficient. Mr. Fullenkamp: I'm saying to train this person and then to put them into this part-time position to do 15 hours a week or something, whatever. Mrs. Lommatzsch: Share the job. Mr. Fullenkamp: To share the job. If this is truly an issue the amount of work that is having to be done by the Police Clerk, then is there a way to train a person that we already have in-house? Mr. Carpenter: What we were trying to do is work with Dawn on training her to do more admin work because right now there is no support at the Safety Services Building for the Service Department and this is where Renee helps. That work has to come over here to be done. If we could possibly have another part-timer over there to help the Service Department because they are so close now that they could be the fill in and it would be more realistic to do it that way.

Mr. Fullenkamp: I don't want to throw this administrative pool idea out before we fully test it and see if it works or not because we went to this three years ago and I haven't seen any effort on the part of the administration to cross train people and now we are saying it just doesn't work very well. It may not work very well because there has been a lack of effort in providing these people with the appropriate training. That's my only idea here and I know everybody likes to do a certain job and have a well-defined position, but in an organization like this we have a lot of needs and we don't have a lot of resources as this budget points out. Mr. Carpenter: Agreed. Mr. Fullenkamp: I would encourage staff and administrative staff to really put some thought into can we realistically cross train these people to fill these needs more effectively? If it can't be done for whatever reason then we should revisit this, but I just haven't seen a true effort to do what was initially proposed to the Council with that administrative pool. You can all correct me if I'm wrong. Mr. Carpenter: Each administrative person has a lot to do, so to take them off and to do the training certainly can be done, but then the work they normally do doesn't get done. To make people multitask or to be more familiar with other work, I agree that's great, but to do it consistently and proficiently on a regular basis makes it tough. Mr. Fullenkamp: Okay.

Mrs. Reynolds: But Mr. City Manager, looking at what we are looking at tonight just with what the Chief has brought forth so far that is not included in the \$2.847 million deficit we are looking at and we are talking about adding more staffing to do what we need to find in-house how to do. We need to get our house in order, first of all. Mr. Carpenter: I'm just saying we have been doing it. We've been covering this work, it's just that it could be better. Mrs. Reynolds: At some point in time, you have to pull one of your administrative staff if this need is that great and I can understand the need. I can see this. I understand vacations, sick time, and all of those things. I understand workloads. I also understand that we have a house in disarray right now and we have got to do something. It would be great if he could have his 10 Officers that he asked for when he walked up here. It could be great if he could have a whole staff of clerical people to do everything that needs to be done, but we can't do it so we have to look at ways that we can meet the needs. Mayor Flaute: I wouldn't say we are in a house of disarray. Work is getting done.

Mrs. Reynolds: We are in a house of disarray, Mayor. When you are almost \$3 million under red, we are in a house of disarray. There's something that has got to be done, sir. I'm sorry, but there is something that has got to be done. All of these things are great and everybody that is going to bring something forward tonight has got the greatest ideas in the world. It would be wonderful except maybe the UFO Day. I'm not real sure on that one yet. I've been a little green this week thinking about that one. We've got to look at ways; we've got to cut. We don't have the luxury guys. This is serious. We are in serious poopoo guys. Sorry I have to say that and I'm going to say it all night long because this is something I don't know how we are going to get out of this and you all are bringing in all of these wonderful ideas for us. Do you think any of us want to sit here and say no? We have to say no. Every one of us has to say no. We don't have a choice. Chief Robinson: Then why are we doing

Thursday, November 30, 2017

this? Mrs. Reynolds: We are looking at what we are going to do next year and Mr. Denning brought up at the last meeting he wants to take things to the voters to see how they feel about it. I understand that, but at some point in time we have to start making some serious decisions and we can't put all of our eggs in that basket that the storm water assessment is going to get us where we need to be. It's not guys. It's not. Understand that, it's not. We've got to do some things. Somebody just tell me to shut up now.

Mayor Flaute: So your next idea is adding another vehicle to the lease. I hate adding vehicles. Chief Robinson: I know you do, but somehow or another you have to know there is a price of business. You have to be able to do the things that we want to do or need to do. We are not adding any new cruisers next year whatsoever. This is only adding one unmarked. The unmarked that we use in the Detective Section was never meant to be used on a daily basis. It was meant to be an undercover car, but we drive it every day. It was donated to us; we didn't even buy that or purchase that vehicle. It was given to us by Sandy's. We never wanted to drive that every day. If you look back at the budget last year, we were given \$55,000.00 to lease vehicles last year. We didn't spend \$55,000.00, we only spend \$48,900.00 because we asked for a vehicle last year and we didn't get it. I'm asking you to give me this vehicle this year. It is the same amount of money, \$55,000.00, just like we had in the budget this year. We won't add another cruiser or any cruisers next year, just this one car. If you take that one out of the mix and put it back where it actually belongs to be. That's what I'm asking to do for that.

Mayor Flaute: So it is not an additional cost? I didn't quite understand your logic here. Chief Robinson: Last year we were given \$55,000.00 and it was denied last year, so we ended up spending the \$48,900.00 for the vehicles we have on the lease, which is three brand new cruisers and two other unmarks. We didn't get the other vehicles, so I'm asking you to let me have the unmarked this year so I can take that other car out of the mix. We are not buying any other cruisers next year or leasing any other cruisers next year, not probably until the year after and it will probably be only one more addition of a cruise next year. The rotation is about five years. The upside of that is you have to look at the maintenance of the vehicles. This is where the savings comes in. The amount we had in the maintenance of the vehicles last year or this year, you will see that we saved thousands because the vehicles are new and that's the only reason why. The rotation is actually working, so you have to look at the money we saved. We only asked this year for \$10,000.00 less in vehicle maintenance than we had last year, so you see how that works out. It benefits and there is an upside, we are spending 5 but we save 10. That's going to be the trend continually if we continue to be able to trade those vehicles in at the appropriate year.

Mr. Fullenkamp: So what you are telling us is we need to plan on \$55,000.00 a year from now until the end of time to do this rotation? Chief Robinson: No, not necessarily because the two unmarked that we have right now will drop off the next year or the year after. Those two will come off and that is \$18,000.00 that will drop off. Can it increase? Absolutely, if you are going to buy more cruisers. Mr. Fullenkamp: I'm saying to keep the same amount of cruisers on the rotation what I'm seeing is we are going to spend approximately \$50,000.00 or \$55,000.00 a year to do this five year rotation. Chief Robinson: Or more. Mr. Fullenkamp: That's what I wanted to know. Chief Robinson: But look back in the past, we were given \$120,000.00 every year to buy cars and then the maintenance was \$50,000.00.

Mr. Fullenkamp: So why is this covert operation vehicle? Does it have too many miles on it or is it unreliable? Why do you want it out of the inventory? Chief Robinson: I want it out because that wasn't what it was purposed for at all. It was used for just covert operations. Mr. Fullenkamp: So what is the difference between that car and a Detective car? Chief Robinson: The newest of it really. The other is an older Charger. It does have quite a few miles on it. It was given to us by Sandy's just for that purpose. Mr. Fullenkamp: For? Chief Robinson: Covert operations. Mr. Fullenkamp: And it's not appropriate for Detective operations? Chief Robinson: You can, but eventually you are going to start running into some serious maintenance with it and I would rather avoid that if I could. Mr. Fullenkamp: But you haven't so far. Chief Robinson: There have been a few things, obviously. Mr. Fullenkamp: Okay.

Thursday, November 30, 2017

Mayor Flaute: So you are saying you want to replace it. I don't have a problem with that. Chief Robinson: No, we want to add a vehicle to the fleet because that one was given to us and it needs to be taken out. Mrs. Lommatzsch: It needs to go back to doing what it was supposed to do. Mr. Fullenkamp: No, they are giving it away. They are getting rid of it.

Deputy Mayor Curp: Refresh my memory from when we first put this vehicle leasing program in place. I thought that it identified how many vehicles we were going to rotate in and out each year for a period of time. Chief Robinson: If we rotate them in 2019 and we get three new cars it is going to cost \$99,000.00. Deputy Mayor Curp: What did we set up because a lease program was brought to us several years ago with the same comments you are making this evening and that is if we go to this leasing program and do this rotation maintenance is going to go down, we have replacement cars once we go through the first full rotation for x number of years, four years, five years, or whatever it was that all was going to be good. Is something not working? Chief Robinson: Not from my opinion. It is all good, but you have to figure we didn't get the cars on the lease until two years ago. The two cars that we got are only two years old on the lease and the only new leased cars we are actually going to get we haven't even gotten yet, which are the three new cruisers that they messed up and ordered three black ones. I know how you like the black and whites, so we had to send those back and we haven't even gotten these vehicles. There is still \$31,000.00 in the budget we haven't spent yet because they haven't gotten those vehicles. They were planning on being here in the middle of the month last month and didn't make it. The middle of the month this month, hasn't made it so far. We have been on the phone talking with the Ford dealership and trying to get our vehicles here, but those are the only three we have had. We had the two, then the three.

Mrs. Lommatzsch: I work retail so I'm going to ask you what are they doing for us since they are not fulfilling their contract? Chief Robinson: That's a good question. We haven't had them respond back to us yet. The guy who was doing the vehicles is back to work, but he had to go to the hospital and he almost died. They had somebody else taking his place that had no clue what they are doing, so we went round and round with them about that at first, but the vehicles were ordered a long time ago and when they came in they were black so they had to send them back. Mrs. Lommatzsch: Do we have paperwork to say that they were supposed to be in the right color? Chief Robinson: Yes, it was their fault. Mrs. Lommatzsch: I'm looking at a free car. Chief Robinson: I don't think they are going to give us a free car, but that would be nice. Mrs. Lommatzsch: I work retail; I know how you do business.

Mr. Fullenkamp: I have a question. So has that lease been encumbered for 2017 for the cars that were returned? Mr. Garrett: We've got a purchase order for those cars, but we haven't paid them yet. Mr. Fullenkamp: Okay, so those funds for the first year of the lease are already covered in 2017? Mr. Garrett: That's correct. Chief Robinson: We have already paid a portion of the lease already; it's just the other portion we have not paid because we don't have the cars. Mr. Carpenter: That is for the cars that we already had is what we paid. Chief Robinson: Right, we haven't paid for anything else. Mr. Carpenter: Those are in year 2. Mrs. Reynolds: Do we have a description on our purchase order of what we were ordering? White car or black car? Chief Robinson: That's on the paperwork. They messed it up and they are the ones that said they apologize and reordered them, so according to what I heard they were being built last month. We are probably going to end up with a 2018 which will probably end up helping us out in the long run as far as holding out on getting new vehicles because that is a newer year. If we do five years you are running into 2023 by the time you need to change these vehicles out.

Mrs. Lommatzsch: Maybe they should handle the detailing. Chief Robinson: We are going to ask them for something because we don't use KD Rose, but they are the ones who set it up and we don't really mess with that. They set up all the pricing, so hopefully we are going to get something out of them. Mrs. Reynolds: Does that throw the rotation off as Councilman Curp was asking? Chief Robinson: It depends on how cars are driven. I've been doing car maintenance and service for years when

Thursday, November 30, 2017

I was in my former life and you just have to weigh out the vehicles almost by year. Some vehicles are going to get more miles on them and some vehicles are not. If you have an opportunity to take back and hold on another car for a year that is what you do. We are lucky here that you have been gracious enough to let me do this program so far. I will be honest with you when I was in another former life those cars had 100,000 cars on them, but let me tell you how much money I spent. It was over \$50,000.00 every year on maintenance at least; \$50,000.00-60,000.00 every year on maintenance.

Mrs. Reynolds: That was part of why we went into what we were doing initially and that was why we did this rotation. Mr. City Manager, I'm really concerned hearing this that we have had a lease agreement, Mr. Garrett has put through the purchase order for that lease agreement back whatever the date was months ago, and we don't have the cars and we were supposed to have cars. No, that's not acceptable. Guys, that doesn't get it. Chief Robinson: I can't go down there and force the people that we bought these from to give us cars. They are the only place that sells the cars on the state bid. Deputy Mayor Curp: In this area. Chief Robinson: In this area. Mrs. Reynolds: As Mrs. Lommatzsch indicated, you have an agreement that said this was supposed to take place. Did we do everything on our part we were supposed to do? I'm not wasting anymore time. Would you please get us a report on that and give me the dealership's name because I would be glad to call them? Mr. Carpenter: We will get you an update.

Mr. Smith: I do have a question in reference to the cars. When we originally set this up we were talking about 70,000 miles on the cars and then we would trade them out. Are we close to that mileage after what we have already leased? Chief Robinson: Do you mean with the vehicles we have already leased? Mr. Smith: Yes, with the vehicles we leased two years ago. Is that correct? Mrs. Lommatzsch: That's what the whole discussion is about. Chief Robinson: Yes, those vehicles have nowhere near 70,000 miles. Those two vehicles that you are talking about are the two that are unmarked and the three we got this year are the marked cruisers and we haven't gotten those yet. This is how far the lease has gone into the thing and you have got two more years on the lease on the unmarks and they will be paid for with \$1.00. It will cost us \$1.00 to buy those. We will purchase them for \$1.00 because they won't have high miles on them, so we are going to drive them for years to come. Mayor Flaute: I think we have got the message here and we are going to get a report because we've got to keep moving. We need to know what is going on and make sure it's right. Mr. Carpenter: We will get you an update.

Deputy Mayor Curp: How many Police cruisers do we have, marked cruisers? Chief Robinson: 14. Deputy Mayor Curp: What is the most number of Officers we have on patrol on any given shift? Chief Robinson: It just depends on whatever their detail is. It could be 9-10. Mr. Fullenkamp: In marked vehicles? Chief Robinson: Yes. Mayor Flaute: I thought we only have 4-5. Chief Robinson: You are only talked about people working on the street; you are not talking about if we have an off-duty details going on or football games going on. Those kinds of things you want to have Officers driving vehicles then. You can't run the cars 24 hours a day or that whole maintenance thing is going to blow up in your face. Mayor Flaute: The lease will fix it, right? Chief Robinson: No, we have to repair vehicles if we break them. Fourteen vehicles is not a lot of vehicles for the manpower we have because if one breaks down or two break down or four break down I promise you won't have enough vehicles at some point. It happens. At this point we are rotating some out because they may have recalls on them, if one of them has a recall we have to send it back, so there is one right there. By the time you put five people in the seats and you rotate five people in, you can't drive five cars. They would be blown up and you would have a bazillion miles on them. Mr. Smith: I think the other thing we need to consider there too on vehicle maintenance and damage to the vehicles is the bad guys today don't think anything of crashing into a Police car. Just the other day in the news one guy hit two Police cars. Chief Robinson: That's a tough one right there. Mayor Flaute: I think we got the message. Let's move on.

Chief Robinson: I gave you the numbers on Watchguard. Currently every vehicle has a camera inside of it and it also includes a body mic with that camera. Those

Thursday, November 30, 2017

body cams that the guys and gals wear are not syncing with that camera at all. They have to wear a body mic and the camera at all times in order to have everything come through from the mobile camera and the body cam. What we are trying to do is a five year lease for \$22,000.00. We want to do a lot of things on lease because it stops the upfront cost. As you can see it's \$103,000.00 to actually buy everything we need. The project would upgrade the entire system including the warranties and the reason why that is important is depending on what year it is upwards to \$6,400.00 on warranties on these cameras. Next year half of the cameras will be out of warranty completely next year. The following year the warranties go out on the rest of them. You can see where this would be very costly in regard to if we have something happen with these cameras. The company, Watchguard, is not letting us put warranties on those cameras because of their age after their warranty is gone this next time. You can't get the warranties on these cameras anymore. If we have a problem with them, we are going to have to pay for them. I can't tell you the price of those things and I'm not really sure. I know DVR is expensive, so it could be thousands of dollars to fix all these cameras.

We have downloading issues right now and we've always had downloading issues with them. This is the scenario I tell everybody about our body cameras or our cameras in general. On one end we have a Corvette and on the other end we have a Ferrari. When the system was brand new and we have everything working it is a Corvette and is working at that rate. On the other end you have the computer system that we have or the server; the server is a Ferrari. Everything in between that is a Pinto. That's a fact. If it worked right, it would look like that and what we are working with is like that. We piece mill everything all the time, it is just what we do because we don't have that much money to be able to buy these things. What happens is the wiring over there in that building doesn't work like it is supposed to work, so it takes us literally hours to download our camera system and with the body camera it is even worse because it has HD and the mobile is the same thing. When you park the vehicle because it stays overnight, it has time to download that stuff in so we can get the video from that. Body cams on the other hand, here's the problem with that. We have six and we actually only have five now because one is broken and I sent it back. If you have six people working and it can happen that we have six people working the road where one person doesn't have a camera or five people have the cameras, so when they were those it doesn't give them time to either download or recharge. From the get go we have been beating our heads against the wall with this.

Let me tell you that we are one of the first department's around here that even have body cams. There are other places that have them, but there are not that many. Huber doesn't have them. Kettering doesn't have them. I think you are going to see within the next couple of years that the State is going to mandate that everybody has them. How they are going to pay for that? I don't have any idea, but it's coming down the pike. I guarantee it. More and more prosecutors are asking for all the video and when we have an incident here we all ask that. I want all the videos. Let's see them all. When we don't have one people ask why we don't have those and where his camera is at. We just don't have enough to do that. It also shows we have had it in good times where we have proven people to be wrong with their accusations and we have actually proven where there was some Officer discretions that were unfavorable. That's the whole point of the camera, accountability. I remember when I first started working here there has been a push for accountability. This is just one other layer of it. I wholeheartedly said let's do that. That's what the whole purpose of this was for. It lets us do exactly what it was designed to do, however our system doesn't let us do what we need to do.

What this money will do for us is take us from six body cams to 14 body cams. Each cruiser will have its own body cam attached to it and have a docking station in the car. There are three cameras, one that goes forward, one that videotapes the person in the backseat, and there is also one in the bottom of the camera that you can pan around to be able to shoot anything from other angles. If you pull up on a scene and you are looking straight ahead and some of the action is going on over there, you can twist your camera that way. That's what it is for. The body mic thing that I was talking about will no longer be needed. The body cam will stay in sync with the

Thursday, November 30, 2017

camera that is in the car and they will allow us to get rid of that body mic completely because you won't need it.

The last thing we can talk about on this is we talked about monies to pay for things. I will be honest with you; we have used in the Police Department a lot of monies from other places that we have gotten to purchase things in the City including cars and things like that. This is another thing we can do with money in-house. A lot of the reconstruction that we did at 1791, we used monies from the property room. We talked about those letters earlier that Mrs. Reynolds was talking about. We sent those out and we got a lot of those monies back. It's the same thing now. We have a lot of those letters to send out and we have already done those. We are looking at having some money that will be given back to the City and we want to appropriate that money to be able to fix all the wiring down at that building, so there won't be any cost for us to fix that wiring.

Mrs. Reynolds: Chief, in your budget that we have been working from in the packet, what can you give up in there to make this \$22,750.00 that you need? You said you had \$6,400.00 in warranties or service agreements for the six you have now. Where is that in your budget? Chief Robinson: Those are in the budget already. If you look in there, those are already in there. Mrs. Reynolds: I see the \$22,750.00 for equipment. Chief Robinson: If you look under Contracted Services, those are included in that I'm pretty sure. Mrs. Reynolds: In Contracted Services, there is nothing. Let's see there is \$56,600.00. What all is involved in that \$56,600.00? Chief Robinson: Well it is fingerprinting, storage, LEADS online, printers, OSP tests, Lexis Nexis, OSP terminal, Watchguard warranty, Dell computers, Plan-It, Cell Brite, the Taser contract. You can take out the MVS Range; we are not going there anymore. Mrs. Reynolds: So you spend \$34,000.00 this year in 2017. You all have increased the budget to \$56,600.00. What else is included in that Contracted Services, Mr. City Manager? Mr. Carpenter: I'd have to check my notes, ma'am. I don't know it off the top of my head. Chief Robinson: The GT mapping and CMI, all that stuff is in there too. Mr. Carpenter: I think that was some of the new money for the CMI software. Mrs. Reynolds: So there is nothing in your budget you can give up to cover the \$22,750.00? Chief Robinson: I don't think so. I was given a number to get down to on operations and I got below that number. Mrs. Reynolds: I might ask you to go a little lower. Chief Robinson: We are doing a lot less, I think. I hate to do a lot less than what we did this year to be honest with you.

Mr. Fullenkamp: Three years ago we bought body cams. Chief Robinson: We got a grant. Mr. Fullenkamp: I know we got a grant and then we spent money to upgrade the software and hardware to overcome some of the problems that you talked about and you are saying that didn't work. Chief Robinson: No, for whatever reason CDO was involved in it and Watchguard was involved in it and they could never get that thing to work exactly right. Mr. Fullenkamp: So do we know that we have a solution now? Chief Robinson: This is the solution and to change the wiring. Mr. Fullenkamp: Do you know it is the solution? Chief Robinson: According to what Watchguard said and our conversations with CDO, this is what we need to do to fix this problem. Mr. Fullenkamp: You are just talking about Ethernet wiring and that's not a big deal. I'm not sure why that didn't happen in the interim. Are we in violation of the grant money? What we are going to do with those cameras? Chief Robinson: The grant has run out and we are probably just going to trade those back in to Watchguard or we are going to sell them on Gov Deals probably. Mr. Fullenkamp: Are you saying they are not compatible with this new system? Chief Robinson: No. Mr. Fullenkamp: So we have a real IT plan in place for this time? Chief Robinson: When I have talked to CDO and Watchguard is this would like changing the whole system to that Ferrari that I was talking about.

Mr. Fullenkamp: The cost is \$22,750.00 a year for how long? Chief Robinson: Five years. Mr. Fullenkamp: Then after that there is going to be costs, do you know what those are? Chief Robinson: The same. Mr. Fullenkamp: Are you suggesting that may be another one of those situations where we will be forever paying \$22,750.00 a year? Chief Robinson: Yes. Mr. Smith: Or more. Mr. Fullenkamp: Okay, I just wanted to me sure we understand that. Mr. Denning: But we are going from six body cams to 14, so we are more than doubling the number of body cams that we will have

Thursday, November 30, 2017

available and the body cams will sync with the cruiser cams so two things won't have to download. When they come up and it will all be stored in the car and then it will download at one time together. Chief Robinson: What happens now because our system has separate units. Mr. Denning: You have to put it in a docking station and the body cam downloads and then the car does its thing, but you have two different things going on. Chief Robinson: Eventually they will migrate together. Mr. Denning: With this system, it will all download at the same time off of the car. Chief Robinson: In minutes. We will have 14 so we won't have anybody that won't have a camera unless something breaks and they will download in minutes and they will be charging faster. You will eliminate that \$10,000.00 or whatever it is for the warranties because we won't be paying for those because they are included. Mr. Fullenkamp: We know there are no grant opportunities to support this project? Chief Robinson: Not that I have seen. Mr. Fullenkamp: But we checked into it? Chief Robinson: I can't remember if my Major checked into it or not to be honest with you. I don't think so though.

Mrs. Reynolds: Mr. City Manager, have you been involved in any of the demos on this? Have you looked at this system? Mr. Carpenter: No, ma'am. Mrs. Reynolds: Will you be doing that? Mr. Carpenter: I can do that if Council would wish that we proceed or would you like me to look into it before approval? Mrs. Reynolds: I think this is something and the Chief just answered Mr. Fullenkamp's question, when the new Jaguar model comes out we are looking at just carrying this on. I would think we would need to know we have everything in place to make it work and that it will work. Chief, not that I'm doubting anything you have seen, but here again you thought everything was good the last time. We thought everything was good and we found out that it was a failed system. We need to have all eyes on something like this. Mr. Fullenkamp: I don't want to buy another lemon and the salesman will tell you anything and that's my question. Mr. Carpenter: The other thing I think the Chief has talked about was the wiring there, it is just not sufficient and he's come up with a way to pay for that wiring through the property room funds. That needed and upgrade according to CDO and Watchguard. If we take care of that, it is definitely going to be a big improvement and it will be compatible with this new system.

Mrs. Reynolds: When do you anticipate having those quotes for the wiring? Chief Robinson: CDO has not given us any yet, but I spoke with him the other day. Mr. Denning: Does the wiring include a new server or switch or router or anything? Chief Robinson: I don't think so. They said that server we have will be just fine. Mr. Fullenkamp: But the router itself. Chief Robinson: It will include all of the equipment we need to make it work. Mr. Denning: So it is not just wiring, it includes everything we would need. Chief Robinson: The wiring in the building is separate. Mr. Denning: Okay. I work in that business, so I need a little more detail. We will talk offline. Mayor Flaute: Anything else, Chief?

Chief Robinson: Cellbrite is the cell phone reader that we use. The money for that is in Contracted Services for the yearly annual fee for this. Unfortunately the machine itself is now out of date and we need to purchase a new one and they are \$3,000.00. You know what this thing does, it extracts information from any cell phone we can get our hands on regarding crimes that have been committed and we use them to download information. This is imperative that we have this thing. It is a very good machine and has worked out for many different cases we have used it on. You can see right here that we use this 15-18 times a month and we do use it for other agencies and we use that as if you will leverage for them to do stuff for us for free as well. We do stuff for them and it is a give and take kind of thing. When we need someone to do a polygraph or something like that, we will use them so we don't have to pay for it. That's what we need this money for. It's not a lot for that piece of machinery and it does a lot of good things.

Mr. Smith: What kind of training is involved to run that machine? Chief Robinson: I think the operators have to go either a week or two weeks of training and it is quite expensive. When we got the original machine itself, we got a grant for everything other than the training and we had to send somebody there. That was expensive to get that done. Mr. Smith: What kind of money are we talking about for training? Chief Robinson: I think it was a couple thousand dollars probably or something like

Thursday, November 30, 2017

that. Mr. Smith: So almost as much as the equipment itself? The equipment we have now, did we buy that new right when it came out? Chief Robinson: That's right. Mr. Smith: How many years of service did we get out of it? Chief Robinson: I think three. There will be no more updates on it. In the middle of next year by June or July that machine won't have anymore updates. It's like having a paint machine and all of the sudden the pad they send you the updates on is exactly the same way. They send you the updates to be able to use it for different phones and then it won't update at all.

Mr. Smith: The training you say is a couple thousand dollars. Is that per person? Chief Robinson: Yes, per person. Mr. Fullenkamp: That includes travel. Chief Robinson: They are staying at the hotel or wherever they are staying at. Mr. Smith: How many people presently know how to run this machine? Chief Robinson: Three and one probably doesn't use it very often and wouldn't be very proficient at it because they haven't had the chance or opportunity to use it very much. We have a Detective who currently runs the machine now and Major Sturgeon is certified to run it, he was the first one to go to the school. Mr. Smith: So you have to be certified to run the machine? Chief Robinson: Yes, sir. Mr. Smith: So everybody that runs the machine has to take the class? So we could be looking at \$10,000.00 to buy and implement this machine. Chief Robinson: No. Mr. Smith: If training is a couple thousand dollars. Chief Robinson: We already have people trained and we don't need any other people trained, so there is no new training. Mr. Smith: Okay, so no new training. Chief Robinson: No, we don't need anybody else. We have three and don't need anybody else to go to training. The fee is just a yearly fee of \$300.00-400.00 and that's for the updates.

Mr. Denning: We have to get this new machine because the old one will no longer be upgradable to stay up with the new phones. Chief Robinson: Exactly. Mrs. Lommatzsch: It's a new Ferrari. Mr. Smith: What about the person with the old flip phone and he's the bad guy and that's the phone he has? Can this new reader read that flip phone? Chief Robinson: Yes. Mr. Smith: Oaky. Chief Robinson: You have to see this thing in action. It comes in a huge case with 40 different inputs and outputs and all those things to attach so many phones it is ridiculous. When we say we've used it 15-18 times, that's probably 10 times that at least. It's been used recently in homicides and everything else. It's a very useful tool. Mrs. Lommatzsch: I don't think we can afford not to have this. Mr. Smith: I agree. Mayor Flaute: Anything else, Chief? Chief Robinson: That's it. Mayor Flaute: Okay, you've heard our concerns and hopefully we will be getting good news from you. Chief Robinson: Absolutely. Thank you, sir.

There were no additional questions or comments.

#### B) 2018 Budget – Planning and Program Management

Mr. Carpenter introduced Mr. Taylor from Planning and Program Management.

Mr. Taylor: You all have the presentation here. I wanted to go over some of the core elements of the things that we do to remind everyone. We really have three core operations: Planning, Program Management, and what I call Regulation which is BZA, Permitting, and Zoning. I also wanted to provide you with our Goal Statement which kind of provides the direction for what we are trying to accomplish and then of course our Mission Statement, I know you all have had a chance to read that. Then we have Core Goals that have come out of that Mission Statement that we are trying to do: Community Enrichment, Community Service, and Sustainability. I like to always talk about sustainability, it has kind of gotten taken over by the "Green Movement" if you will and that's not exactly what that always entails. To me Community Sustainability is making sure that we can continue to provide the same level of service yearend after yearend and how we fund and pay for that. That's being sustainable, especially functionally and fiscally. Everything kind of revolves around those three Core Goals and those elements inside the Goals. We were asked to give this presentation about programs and projects or things we need and then to write them and I have put these in order of the way I would like to present them of

Thursday, November 30, 2017

most important to least, except for UFO Days, which I think should be first and we will talk about that last.

The Comprehensive Plan Update, as you know or may not know this isn't mandated by our Charter but is one of those things you have to have. It is way out of date, but I still think there is good information in there. We are not talking about doing a complete overhaul of this we are talking about doing an update. This impacts a lot of my functions inside of my department and I think it affects other departments as well. It would also assist in guiding a Strategic Plan from the Comprehensive Plan and usually those documents work hand in hand together. It also helps with our Land Use and kind of gives the legal backing behind that and assists in development and where. The document we have does a good job, it just needs updated and it's over 10 years old.

I looked into talking to a couple of different consultants. I've got one really good price for what they have done. He has looked at our Comprehensive Plan and read through it. We have had some discussions and he gave me a quote and that quote was I think \$32,500.00 and that involved doing a couple of community meetings, meeting with you folks, meeting with the Planning Commission and talking about the current Comprehensive Plan and what needs to be added to it, and of course doing, I don't want to call them focus groups, but maybe some charettes to bring some people in and get some input from the citizens. I'm thinking and with the other people I have talked to that's about where we are at for an update. A complete overhaul to redo this you are looking at \$85,000.00-100,000.00. This is probably the most economic way to do this is to have this consultant. There is also the Land Bank grant that we can combine with this which is a 25/75 split, so at \$35,000.00 we are talking \$8,750.00 is all we really need. Then of course we have to appropriate what we ask for a \$35,000.00 ask on the Comprehensive Plan. In addition, this will also help with the UDO. I know we have talked about it and done some updates, but I think once you have that Comprehensive Plan in we can really start talking about how we want our UDO to work and how does it work with that new Comprehensive Plan and then we can set those gears in motion and look at a really good comprehensive UDO with our Land Use and development and how we want to do that.

Mr. Fullenkamp: The consultant will be an expert in land use? He will be able to go in and find out what are the best land uses or uses of land and whatever provides the best return and the best amenities for the residents? We are land locked and we have limited ability to make mistakes. Mr. Taylor: Our land use, some of the things we are looking at that we are going to talking about and some of the things we have already run into as far as issues are these corridors. I think a great example is right along Valley Street, all of those old houses there are zoned B-2. That's where we want to go is a very business district through there, but what we really need to do is some transitional zoning, so a Land Use Plan like that will explain transitional zoning and how you implement that. I'm hoping when we get out of this it will kind of build a plan to say we know we want commercial along that corridor, but here are some different zoning and land use techniques that you can use and implement to get there because just zoning at B-2 doesn't work.

Mr. Fullenkamp: I understand that, but what I'm after is do we have an idea of how to best utilize the remaining property that we have for commercial and residential purpose. There's a payoff to the City for doing things one way and payoff in another way, do we know what's best for the City in the long term? I'm thinking there are experts out there that have looked at cities and can tell you here are a range of options that you have and here are the benefits and the costs of each of them. Then you choose from that menu and then you go to the public and say here is what we think are the best uses for these properties or these regions of town and then you get public input. Mr. Taylor: I think if an update on the Comprehensive Plan is something you want to fund, I think those are great and that would be the question when we bring the person in. The one estimate is from a former Dayton employee who is a Planner. We would want to interview and talk to different consultants about exactly what you talked about plus other things. Mr. Fullenkamp: We don't have a lot of room to make mistakes. We can't just go out to the fringes and continue to develop because we are land locked. Mr. Taylor: I think when you look at the Goal Statement

Thursday, November 30, 2017

and the Mission Statement, everything I'm trying to propose here is to move the City forward into something. If we want we can end this really quick, if you want to just keep this status quo we can end this tonight and I will sit down because we can continue to do that easily and everything I'm asking for is to be in addition to and to move the City forward. Mrs. Reynolds: Your department should be able to fix the problem, but have a long term plan so we know where we are going when we fix that problem. That's where we lack sometimes. Mr. Taylor: When we get to the next one, I want to address that very statement.

Civic Express, we are currently using Zone Pro which is probably the best \$570.00 a year program you can get; hands down for \$570.00 a year you cannot beat this program. Every city around us is using million dollar programs. They spend a million to put in Accela. They have put in \$100,000.00 for this and we are using the best \$600.00 program on the market. We can continue to work that way and there are some issues with Zone Pro that we need to clear up if we were to move to Civic Express. There is some bad data in, bad data out. There are a lot of files that need cleaned up. If we don't go with Civic Express, we are going to move through to try and improve the workability for staff. What that doesn't do is it doesn't improve an enhanced experience for the customer. What happens with this is there is no permit tracking ability. We have permits come in and we can see when they come in, but there is no counter, where is it at, who is looking at it, did it go to the Service Department, is it at the Fire Department, is it still sitting on Emily's desk, is it on my desk? There is no tracking. There is also no easy way to download a report. You can download a report to see what's in the queue, but there is really no easy way to do that quickly. There's no connectivity. You can access it online and look at permits, but you can't submit anything online. I can't put a note in there and send a note to say to Jeremy that I talked to this person and send him a notice to say I talked to this resident and they are going to have their issue fixed tomorrow. He would have to manually load that up, go to that file, look at it, move to that page, see there is a new note and then read my note. That is cumbersome.

It also lacks accountability. We talked about cross training and we talked about training staff. When something is entered in erroneously or incorrectly by accident or whatever into Zone Pro we have no idea who did it. There is no log of who entered in what in Zone Pro, so we have no clue. We can't expand, it does what it does and it is the best \$570.00 program in the world. Deputy Mayor Curp: Is that because there is no provision in there or because we don't use the capability that it has to track who did what? Mr. Taylor: I will be honest. I don't play with it a lot as far as expanding, but there is no permit tracking available. I've heard talk about trying to do a building department, which I think would be a great idea. There is no way to use that for this. It doesn't do more than we use it for most likely. Is it going to move us into the future and make a better, enhanced experience for the citizens and the residents? No, it's a \$500.00 program.

Civic Express, what is great about it is it is a web-based program. On the web-based program, it is not designed for us it is designed for the customer. Where this is really great is if for example Ryan Homes. If we had another subdivision and they were building 100 homes, they create their own account and if I'm using it and Huber Heights uses it and they have two others that are starting to use this locally, but they have one account and there will be Riverside and let's say Huber Heights and they can say today I want to submit permits for Huber Heights and Riverside and they can do all of that from their portal page and never have to leave their office and can send us the stuff and input it directly. We can use this for CAP Signs and anyone who uses permits on a regular basis can create an account and then watch their process and permits individually from their portal.

The other thing it does is have a suite of services and we pay for that entire suite. If we want to go to a building department and add that, which I am certified to run a building department if anyone wants to know, we can expand from here. We don't have to buy a new program. We don't have to look into what we are going to do. We can just expand from this without adding dollars to our contract, unless we add users, it is all based on how many users we have. They approached us last year and we were looking at a couple different programs. We worked with them on their BETA

Thursday, November 30, 2017

testing on their Zoning and Code Enforcement Module. They didn't have one, they were looking at building one, and they were starting to put it together. We had a lot of input and a lot of work that helped create that suite. It would be very user friendly for us as well. Inside of it if I wanted to send a message or if Melissa from Ryan Homes had a question when she submits a permit, she can click who she wants that to send an email to. From that portal, she can send me an email or she can send Emily an email and if there is somebody else in her organization, she can send them an email to say she has submitted this permit. We can go through, make notes, and of course there is a lot of scanning, so it doesn't have electronic plan review; it doesn't do that. Those programs are very expensive and we don't get those kinds of permits.

The other thing it allows us to do is process credit card payments at no cost to us. I believe it is a 3% charge to the user; it's on that paper I believe. Now we are a cash business up here only, now we can process credit cards at the front desk or online if somebody wants to submit that way. I think this really enhances how we would process and how we would move permits; I think it would streamline the process and benefit the end user which is businesses and residents. If you don't have access to a computer, that is why I'm asking for a Zoning/Planning Technician.

Mr. Fullenkamp: Can we go back to Civic Express? Have you compared this package to anything else out there? Mr. Taylor: I have talked to another company; I can't remember what they were. There are a lot of these what I would call mid-grade systems. What I liked about Civic Express is they are local out of Cincinnati. Mr. Fullenkamp: Columbus. Mr. Taylor: Were they in Columbus? Anyway, it is a husband and wife set up, they have been very responsive to emails and talking. They came and did several presentations for us. The other companies, they are very salesmanish. It doesn't feel like there is customer support behind it. Mr. Fullenkamp: I'm going to burst your bubble; Civic Express does not exist anymore. Mr. Taylor: Are you kidding me? Mr. Fullenkamp: They canceled it in August. Mr. Taylor: Well that sucks. Mr. Fullenkamp: I talked to Kerry Kicos yesterday and they cut it off in August. Mr. Taylor: Well this is really great that we don't do this program.

Mr. Fullenkamp: That's one of the points of going with these small businesses is they don't have the resources to follow through some times. Even if they have the product you want, they can go away real quick. That's why we all say Accela is way too much, well Accela has resources and they produce products. I know they are expensive, I understand that, but we are buying software for you, the Clerk wants some software, the Finance Department wants some software, and I'm looking at a suite. Maybe we've got to go to something that is more integrated. I don't know if we could include Fire and Police and the Service Department in the same process, but Tech Dog got out of this business in August. Kerry is a very nice lady and she was very upfront about it. Mr. Taylor: I'm very disappointed they didn't call me to let me know. Mr. Fullenkamp: She said, "I probably should have called him." I said, "Don't worry. I'll be talking to him." Mr. Taylor: Awesome. Well that could have saved like 10 minutes.

Mr. Fullenkamp: Again, I think an important point here is there is a risk dealing with these mom and pop organizations, whether it be a Finance package, a Zoning permit package, a packet development/minutes/legislation package. Sometimes that small vendor doesn't have the resources to stick it out. Mr. Taylor: You are making a really great argument for us to go to something more expensive and I'm with you. Mr. Fullenkamp: I don't want to go low grade and then not deliver. I think it is important and if we are going to do this, this has to be something more of a long term planning thing. I saw something in the Finance Department and they want to buy some transparency software, I'm not sure exactly what that \$9,000.00 is for that I saw in that part of the budget. Mrs. Lommatzsch: We don't need to talk about this anymore. Mr. Fullenkamp: About what? Mrs. Lommatzsch: This. Mr. Denning: I think the point is maybe if we take \$10,000.00 from each department and we end up with \$100,000.00 maybe there is something that will fit for everybody. Yeah, we may have to spend a little more, but this is going to be more robust and everybody will be able to use it and I think that's what we need to look into. Mr. Fullenkamp: An integrated approach might be more suitable instead of everybody buying their own piece.

Thursday, November 30, 2017

Mr. Taylor: The other thing I have been looking at too and I will throw this out there because I have been trying to talk to Fairborn about this is that they have gone to an all-electronic system and they have their own Building Department and I don't have to use the County's Building Department, I can use any Building Department I want, so there is also a chance there were we could just piggy back into their system, have a façade program where it says City of Riverside so it looks like our Building Department, but we are going through them. That's something we can look into which I am going to make as a priority to find out where we are on that because I was really banking on Civic Express.

What we are trying to do with the Zoning/Planning Technician is that Emily spends a lot of her time as a Zoning Administrator trying to get some sort of drawing that is legible that you can approve a permit on. I am not kidding we had a permit not too long ago where it was literally a box drawn in a box that said new shed. What do I do with this? Mrs. Lommatzsch: Don't accept it. Have a standard, don't accept it. Mr. Taylor: We don't always accept that. That comes in where we talk about having a Technician who will sit with that person and say we can't accept this, we need you to do this and explain to the homeowner that what they need and then assist them. We have an obligation that when you are a homeowner and you are not a general contractor and you build one shed every 15 years, you don't know what you need. What do I need to give to the City to get my project done? Mrs. Lommatzsch: That's the person's contractor's job.

Mr. Taylor: Not everyone is using a contractor and I think that is another problem we have too, we have a lot of contractors. When I was in Dayton we had a lot of the same contractors that would give me something that was very usable in Dayton that I could approve and here in Riverside, they give us junk. Mrs. Lommatzsch: Then don't accept junk. Why should we accept junk in Riverside? I'm tired of hearing that. I've been hearing it for 20 years. Don't accept junk. If it can't be read then she needs to say, "I need a copy that I can understand." Mr. Taylor: That's what I'm trying to get to, that takes a lot of time. You are more than welcome to come and listen or talk to the residents that we talk to and try and get what we need from them. It is very time consuming, it is very frustrating. Mrs. Lommatzsch: Who wants the shed?

Mr. Fullenkamp: I think one of the things we could do better is to provide a set of guidelines for people that submit permits. Mr. Denning: Better instructions. Mr. Fullenkamp: Here is a checklist. Mrs. Reynolds: Give them an example, that's what they need. Mr. Taylor: We have that on our permits. Mr. Fullenkamp: Give them a checklist, literally a checklist, you have to give us this and this. Mr. Taylor: When I say give me an elevation plan. Mr. Fullenkamp: You don't say it that way; you use common language for them. Deputy Mayor Curp: Don't use jargon. Mr. Taylor: Then you ask for a picture. Mr. Fullenkamp: That's not going to make it perfect, but a checklist and some guidelines is going to improve that process. That's all. Mr. Taylor: I agree with you and those are not things we haven't thought about. Having a person to sit down and explain to you that we need an aerial photo, where to get a site plan, where to get lot lines, how they do this. I can explain how to do that on the County website or I can do it on our GIS or I can do that for you and help you with that. That's customer service.

Mrs. Lommatzsch: We can't afford this person, so we are going to have to find a way to fix it. Mr. Taylor: Like I said everything I'm asking for is to improve services or we can keep the status quo, that's fine with me. Mrs. Reynolds: We can improve services Mr. Taylor just as some of the suggestions we have made. A lot of people that come in have no idea as Mr. Fullenkamp just pointed out when you say you need elevation, that's just not words they are used to hearing. If we have a piece of paper that says: here is your house, and you want to put your shed where, and this property line, this is how wide your property line is, how deep it is. It is just a simple little thing. Mr. Taylor: Yeah and have a person to do that for them. Mrs. Reynolds: No, we could just give them an example. We could do all of those little examples up and give it to them with the packet, this is what we need. Mr. Taylor: We do that. We do these things. This is what I'm saying, this takes time. A lot of the times permits come in, she's on the phone so she is not always up there. If every time

Thursday, November 30, 2017

somebody came in to drop a permit to explain this to them, she wouldn't have time to review things. These sheds, fences, decks are the most time consuming permits.

Mrs. Reynolds: What administrative assistant is assigned to this department? That's who you train to do this. Mr. Carpenter: There is no one assigned. He works with Becky and Pam. Mr. Taylor: I work with Becky and Pam up at the front desk to assist. They do a lot of the ZonePro entries, so when a permit comes in they look at that and then take that permit. We could train them to go through that, but again while they are doing that a phone is not getting answered in three rings or there are other things that aren't getting done. Mrs. Reynolds: These girls are all experts in their field. If one is talking to a customer, somebody else will pick up the phone. Deputy Mayor Curp: I think if this person is going to be busy and the phone is going to ring. That scenario doesn't go away. Mr. Taylor: It improves. The more people you have answering phones. Every time we add more people, we add more work that can get done. I understand we are in a crunch. I was asked to bring together projects, list them, and if we don't want to look at any projects, you have seen them. We can wrap this up. Mayor Flaute: We need new projects. Mrs. Lommatzsch: Please don't take anything personally. Mayor Flaute: We can't afford another person. Mr. Taylor: That's fine. I'm just explaining the extra level of service we can provide with an additional person.

The Stebbins Revitalization Program, we have talked about that a lot. I don't know where we are on it right now. Mr. Carpenter: I can give you an update on that and that's why I withdrew the legislation for this evening is that Tuesday night I ran into Mr. Ellender and Mr. Wyen and we talked about this project. I think there was a misunderstanding. The intent was to get out of it, we must always own the property and purchase the property, but then we would get out of the funding. What we learned was that the schools cannot purchase materials and use them on properties they don't own. As a result of that conversation, I got proposals for a new MOU yesterday. I had my comments back and so what we are looking to do is just eliminate the 80/20 split that was in the MOU, create a fund for the City, and this is where the money would stay and after the sale of the property and the project is complete, the City would get reimbursed, the school would get reimbursed for their expenses, and then if there was any additional funds that Council would wish to donate and cover. That's where we are today. Mayor Flaute: And that's why you are pulling it off is because the new language is not in the legislation you wanted to approve tonight. Mr. Carpenter: Yes.

Mr. Fullenkamp: What costs are reimbursable to the school and to the City? Mr. Carpenter: The examples I was given is some transportation costs and then I mentioned what if the tools they are using would break or they would need some additional tools that they don't currently have, those would be some examples. Mr. Fullenkamp: The City's costs would be the same thing? Transportation costs. Mr. Carpenter: Our cost would be primarily to reimburse the money we put up in the fund for materials. Mr. Fullenkamp: And the contractor? What about legal fees and that sort of thing? Mr. Carpenter: We didn't have those on the list. Mr. Fullenkamp: We have had to put this agreement together. Mr. Carpenter: That was not on the list. Mr. Fullenkamp: So no labor by the City or no labor by the schools is included in a reimbursement plan? Mr. Carpenter: No. Mr. Fullenkamp: Thanks.

Mr. Carpenter: I will say the contractor and then the architect because we have an architect that does the initial walk through and bounced the ideas off of them and use their expertise to make sure we can do the project. Mr. Fullenkamp: For instance, while a home is being remodeled, who is responsible for taking care of the lawn and everything? Mr. Carpenter: That would be the City. Mr. Fullenkamp: That would be reimbursable too? Mr. Carpenter: I would say yes, I did not factor that specific one in there, but that is a good example. Mr. Fullenkamp: There is an assortment of things that could occur, like on Hazelton there is that tree against that fence that is going to be a cost. Mr. Carpenter: Yeah, I can't say we factored in the routine stuff, but to do the project that's what we focused on. Mrs. Reynolds: Will you send us a list of those things? Mr. Carpenter: The best we can. I don't know if it will be all inclusive, but we can get some good examples. Mr. Fullenkamp: I sent you a list of questions that I

Thursday, November 30, 2017

need some responses to. Mr. Carpenter: It will be coming to you all soon. Mr. Fullenkamp: Thank you.

Mr. Taylor: Sidewalk Assessment Development, I want to preface this that we applied for a CDBG grant earlier this year. We had asked for \$60,000.00 for \$160,000.00 project to do the handicap curb ramps and to do those in the Tall Oaks neighborhood. I got the update today from the County and they are going to award us \$50,000.00, not the \$80,000.00. The best way to make sense of that is we had taken an average cost of each ramp, multiply that by how many that was, and that's how we came up with that \$160,000.00. We will take that \$50,000.00, add in our \$50,000.00, and then we would do as many ramps. The way I would see this is we would start at the southern part of that neighborhood and just work our way up this year and do as many as we can. As we do that put together a plan for the following year to finish the rest.

With that, this goes hand in hand with that project to start developing and making sure we have our sidewalk assessment in place so that we can start capitalizing on those curb ramps and fixing sidewalks throughout that neighborhood. That estimated \$15,000.00, that's a WAG. I'm not exactly sure how much costs we are going to have in this. I'm looking at with Choice One creating a tool that we could use to rate sidewalks, so you have a 1-5 system and what that looks like. What we can do then is train myself or anybody in the City or a volunteer or the Code Enforcement Officer can go through and assess using their criteria of what is a 1 and what is a 5, which of course is going to be a perfectly maintained, brand new sidewalk and a 1 is very similar to the pictures we showed in that heaving concrete that needs to be replaced right away. Then we would have some sort of policy written that we would work with Choice One on some sort engineering standards when we do a sidewalk assessment and what the criteria is for that and what number we are going to start replacing sidewalks at 1's and 2's or 1, 2, and 3's.

That's kind of the development of that program. I believe to do the assessment we may already have it in place because I think we used to do one. Mrs. Lommatzsch: There's got to be. Mr. Fullenkamp: We have legislation. Mrs. Lommatzsch: We don't have to reinvent the wheel. Jay's shaking his head. Mr. Keaton: There was a standard back in the day. Mr. Taylor: We want to put that together and make sure we can then assess. The biggest thing is once we get those criteria of how we are going to rate sidewalks, and then we will go through the Tall Oaks neighborhood and figure it out. Okay, we have \$250,000.00 worth of sidewalk we need to replace in that neighborhood, let's put together a budget and a plan to attack that over a year process because I know we are not going to spend that much money to fix it all. Of course then we would continue to move the program through the other neighborhoods and we would then just repeat. Mr. Fullenkamp: I don't think you have to assume that everyone will want to be assessed, some people will come out of pocket right away so you won't need to have that much funding in place or they will get their own contractor to meet our standard. Mr. Taylor: There are a dozen ways we can do this. We can offer them our contractor, we can offer for them to get their own contractor. Mr. Fullenkamp: All I'm suggesting is that we are going to have to set aside some funds to pay for it for the resident to own it and we will have to figure out how much that needs to be when we decide to go forward. Mr. Taylor: Doing that is exactly what we are proposing to do here.

Mayor Flaute: We already have a sidewalk program in place. We have done sidewalks; the last 20 years we have been doing sidewalks. Mr. Taylor: We haven't done sidewalks since I have been here. Mayor Flaute: I know, but we have done sidewalks. I know, I had to do them in front of my house and I'm still not happy about it. It's been done. Mr. Taylor: Nobody likes to be told to maintain their property. I know that. Mayor Flaute: Somewhere in this City there is a plan on how to do your sidewalk, how to get them on the taxes, and all that stuff. It's there, but if you need Choice One. Mr. Taylor: The legislation was backed up on old Code because I think I found legislation from 2003 and it was referencing Code sections that don't exist anymore. We have to put the program back together and work on it. Mr. Denning: You don't have to reinvent the wheel. Mayor Flaute: Don't spend a lot of money on

Thursday, November 30, 2017

Choice One because you have got all the information in there that they are probably going to give you.

Mr. Fullenkamp: We can assess right now to do sidewalks that are in our Code. Deputy Mayor Curp: Or we can just give citations to the property owner and tell them to fix their sidewalks or else. It's not rocket science. When we say we haven't done any sidewalks since somebody's been here, why not? Mr. Fullenkamp: We have chosen not to. Deputy Mayor Curp: All you have to do is go down the sidewalk and say this sidewalk and this apron are crumbling, sorry Mr. Property Owner or Miss Property Owner, you need to fix this. Mr. Taylor: I can tell you from today that is easier said than done. Mayor Flaute: I agree that we need to do certain parts of the City at a time. That's what a program is all about, but that program exists. Deputy Mayor Curp: If you have tree roots that are heaving sidewalks and they are a safety issue, you don't have to do a formal program like this to get that fixed. I'm sorry, you don't. Mr. Fullenkamp: Yeah, it's in our Code. Mr. Taylor: I can take people to court and I will get a \$10.00 fine and they don't get told to do it. Mr. Fullenkamp: You can do the work and assess their property for it. Mr. Taylor: I can do that, but then I would need the money to do that. Mr. Fullenkamp: That's right. Mr. Taylor: Which I'm about to ask for.

I can't fix sidewalks without money, so here we go talking about demolition and abatement. This is an additional \$60,000.00, I spent \$49,000.00 this year and \$30,000.00 of that is mowing people's yards and pulling trash out. We spend a lot of money picking up people's trash and mowing their yards. With this additional \$60,000.00, I'm looking to do some more board ups and we pressed that Property Nuisance language where it mentioned to use that. We've got about six buildings that we want to start going on and the ultimate goal is to tear those down. Some of those are buildings that were in the NIP program, there were two or three that we couldn't REAP through the NIP program and they got kicked out for one reason or another. I think going through the Property Nuisance we will be able to get those and tear them down. That's what some of this money is for. Some of this money is for if you tell somebody to do their sidewalk and they don't want to and we just do it and assess them. If you want me to do all the sidewalks, I will take as much money as you want to put in that and I will spend it. Honestly, if you want to put \$1 million in there, I can spend it. Mayor Flaute: We know that. Mr. Taylor: We've got a lot of houses to tear down and we need to fix a lot of sidewalks. Mayor Flaute: There is a program out there, please follow it. Mr. Taylor: That's pretty much what I'm asking for there. I thought \$60,000.00 was reasonable and that almost doubles that number. When I first came we were at \$59,000.00-60,000.00 in that account. It has been whittled down to \$49,000.00. If you want to make it \$100,000.00 today for the whole account or leave it at the \$49,000.00. As of today, I have spent everything but \$398.00 of it. We use that and we have been very aggressive and we will be as aggressive as money allows.

Mr. Fullenkamp: So we are acquiring properties, tearing houses down, we have grassy lots. What is the plan to maintain those lots? Mr. Taylor: As of right now, I don't know if other departments have obtained lots and I don't know what their plan is. I haven't obtained any of those. My goal would be in each neighborhood there to be a different plan. Parts of Avondale want to hold onto those and Land Bank them. Other parts we want to divide them. Mr. Fullenkamp: I'm talking more specifically about maintenance. Mr. Taylor: What we do with them right now for vacant lots, they are put on a one month rotation with our contractor and he maintains them that way. Mr. Fullenkamp: Is that sufficient for a specific neighborhood? Does it match the appearance of surrounding properties? Mr. Taylor: It does. We didn't have any complaints about those, so putting them on a one month rotation worked out really well with the contractor because I don't know how many of those repeat ones that we have and most of them we don't own. Mr. Fullenkamp: That's not abatement though, correct? That's a different fund. Mr. Taylor: That is out of the abatement fund because we don't own those lots. A lot of them are just vacant, abandoned properties. Mr. Fullenkamp: I'm saying the ones where we tear the house down under the NIP program we acquire the properties as a City. Mr. Taylor: After three years. Mr. Fullenkamp: So the NIP program maintains those. Okay. Mr. Taylor: Or they can give us \$500.00 per lot and we can maintain them. I haven't figured out how

Thursday, November 30, 2017

we are going to do that yet. Right now it is in their ballpark. Mr. Fullenkamp: Then part of the Comprehensive Plan would be to address how we use these lots going forward? Mr. Taylor: I would like to have my Comprehensive Plan talk about different neighborhoods and what our strategies are for those neighborhoods. I have an idea planned in my head that we are trying to work out and this would be a solidification of that. Mr. Fullenkamp: Thanks.

Mr. Taylor: Here's my favorite, UFO Days. I know everyone laughs, but with all joking aside I think it is very important for a community to have an event that has a regional draw. I think we did a really good job with our park things we did this year which were for the residents and I like that. I think that was a great program. The few I went to, I had a good time with everyone. This is one of these events that if you can get a regional draw or even a national or international draw event, people really start to take notice of your community and if it is done right people will come back year after year. It can become a real staple. I think it is very important that whatever event you have fits in with your community and has some sort of identity. I know there are a lot of people that think would you really want to be associated with aliens or UFOs. I think the answer to that is yes. If you really look at this, I feel crazy like I should have a tin foil hat on explaining this. If you read the conspiracy and there is a really great website if you want to check it out at home, it is called World UFO Days and people post their events on there. It is a big thing. They talk about Roswell, New Mexico and that spaceship that we all know crashed in Roswell and came to Hanger 18 which is right across the street. This is a huge opportunity to latch onto something that is nationally known and if done right, I really think you can create an event that isn't embarrassing or silly. Roswell, New Mexico does a four day event that first week of July and it is huge. There is a lot of money involved, there is a lot of tourism, a lot of people come, and people come from all over the world to go.

Mayor Flaute: There was a Harry Potter in the newspaper yesterday. Some small town did it and they were just overwhelmed with people, they had so many people come. I think it is a great idea. Mr. Taylor: I think on a realistic side and you talk about the research and development that goes on at Wright Patt and you see what comes out of that. A UFO doesn't mean aliens, it means an unidentified flying object and there is a lot of research and development. There is a whole hanger over there of old test craft that meets that UFO kind of thing. We have talked to a lot of people on Base, we have talked to a lot of people in the region, and it is very well received. I know where we are at financially; I'm just throwing this out there to lighten the mood. I think it is a great idea and whether we do this or something, we should really be looking at a regional draw event to get people to talk about Riverside in a manner that they don't do already. That's all I have to say about that. Mayor Flaute: I think it is a great idea.

Mr. Fullenkamp: I went to the World UFO Day website. Typically it's sky watching, talking about things, getting the right people there, the people that have experienced it. There are not many big festivals worldwide. We have a chapter in Kentucky, we have a chapter in Michigan, so I understand and I agree with you about the need to have a festival with some meaningful draw ability. I don't know if it is this and I don't know if that's what we want to be about. Mayor Flaute: I was trying to push a sci-fi. We have all these scientists out at the Base Monday through Friday, how do we get them back to Riverside on Saturday? This is something that they are interested in. Mr. Fullenkamp: I agree with a festival about something and typically I think it is about food and music. Mr. Taylor: You would have food or music at both of those. Mr. Fullenkamp: There has got to be a reason to generate something fun.

There were no additional questions or comments.

Mr. Smith: The budget forecasted for next year, are we going to be in a deficit or are we expected to have money left over for next year? Mr. Carpenter? For 2018 we are projecting a deficit, but just keep in mind this sheet here is in your packet and this was a list of the all the projects. Council wanted to see all the projects that the Department Heads submitted, so this is everything. What's green is in the budget. That doesn't mean it will stay in the budget, but this was the first draft and we initially put them in. We still didn't have all the revenue projections and all, but as we keep

Thursday, November 30, 2017

moving forward it's looking like a bigger and bigger deficit. There are certain things that we know. We know what our debt service is, we know major thoroughfare and what to expect with those projects. We are in contract negotiations and with our insurance there are still some variables there. Operations, I asked all the departments to cut their last year budget by 4%. That's what we know. There are still a lot of variables right now, but we know debt service and the major thoroughfare projects what is on the table for that. Mr. Smith: Okay.

C) 2018 Budget – Fire Department

Mr. Carpenter introduced Chief Stitzel from the Fire Department.

Chief Stitzel: I broke mine down into three different types of budget, so we have personnel, operating, and capital. We will talk about personnel first. I tried not to paint such a gloom and doom picture, but to be quite honest with you I am foreseeing a problem in our near future. We are already starting to suffer from this problem and I'm looking at trying to get ahead of it to some degree, but we are seeing some significant and serious issues on the horizon if we continue down the same path we are on. The first slide there will show you a little bit of where we are at as far as personnel. Back in 2006 from what I understand, Council approved the staffing level of 9 people a day. Right now with all best efforts that we have currently for this year, we are averaging about 7 a day. I'm trying to get 9 and some days we are at nine and some days we are at 5. That's a problem. We are just trying to average it out to get up as high as we can.

Some of the problems we are having is the lack of part-time firefighters in the region that are available and our retention of part-time firefighters currently. We were talking earlier about the part-time administrative staff, just keeping somebody in that position for a long period time. There is a lot of training a part-time firefighter. Yeah, they come to us certified already, but to actually learn how to do our operations, our equipment, the way we load our hose, the way we operate and everything there is a lot of training that is involved in that. As soon as they get an offer for a full-time job somewhere else they are gone. A year ago we had 34 part-time people, right now we are at 18. I just lost two others, one a paramedic and one an EMT to full-time jobs. No matter what we do or how much we pay, these part-time people are going to continually look for a full-time job. I have a few that are already full-time somewhere else and work here part-time. We have one that is a retired gentleman that comes in here and works over 6<sup>th</sup> day, an EMT Basic, and he is not going to leave. We have a very small handful that I can say that we have some longevity promises out of, but even the ones that are working full-time on other departments and they come here and work part-time are struggling with staying here because of our pay.

Our pay is an issue. We are probably the lowest paid for our part-time personnel in the region. I just looked at a flyer today from Washington Township and you can make up to \$20.00 per hour as a part-time paramedic/firefighter in Washington Township. Right now our top pay we are paying our part-time paramedic/firefighter is \$12.06 an hour. Asking them to come work here for \$6.00 an hour less, plus we will talk a little bit more about our activity and why there is another issue here, but right now we have five part-time that are paramedics and 13 are EMT Basics. That paramedic card is the golden ticket and that's what I need, I need paramedics. The EMT Basics do a great job of supporting our EMS system, but it's the paramedic that is required. I have to have that paramedic to be able to push drugs, do EKG monitoring, and to do all these kinds of things. That ALS type level of care is done by a paramedic. I can run a medic unit with two paramedics, I can run it with a paramedic and a basic, but I cannot run it without a paramedic. I have to have one and there are days where we are down to three paramedics working a day, I put one on each medic unit, and then the person that is in charge of the shift is a paramedic because they are full-time. We are scratching all the way down to where we are actually ordering full-time people in to work on overtime just to maintain that staffing level, so this is a problem.

At this current pace, I predict that we will be down to almost zero part-time in two years unless something happens or something changes to create that wave of part-

Thursday, November 30, 2017

time people and I have been teaching in the fire service for over 24 years now I've been a Fire Instructor and have been teaching firefighter classes. Pre 9/11 it was fair and was pretty good, after 9/11 we had a big influx of people. Sinclair was teaching 6-8 classes a quarter and we were pumping out 125-150 certified firefighters every quarter and it was just unbelievable how many people wanted to be in the fire service, they wanted to be paramedics, they wanted to be police officers after 9/11. That's gone. Most of the kids that are coming into college today were too young to remember 9/11, so they didn't have that drive to get into the fire service. We are seeing a huge decrease of available part-time people in the entire region. Many departments around us are transitioning over to all full-time departments, Beavercreek and Kettering have very few part-timers and Butler Township is even looking at going all full-time now because they are just struggling to keep that part-time cache of personnel up.

I think we can make this work in another year or two. If we can make some adjustments and make some changes, we can probably try to get it up a little bit to where we can survive. I do believe there is going to become a time in our near future where we are going to be looking at either having a fairly under staffed Fire Department with all full-time or we are going to have to figure out a way to get in all full-time to a higher level than what we have. Right now we have 16 total full-time people and I'm one of those 16, so there are 15 of them out there and 5 on every shift. They work a 24 hour day, so there are 5 assigned to a day. There is typically one or two of them off every day either on vacation leave or an EDO, so you are looking at averaging 3 ½ people a day. Those other slots are supplemented with the part-timers.

Mayor Flaute: How many more personnel would you need to have to not need the part-time folks? Chief Stitzel: We will talk about that activity, I don't want to say just call volume, but our call volume is very high. We are on track to do almost 5,000 calls. I would say to go all full-time right now and have the adequate staffing level for what we are doing we would probably need to triple the size of our department. Right now we have 15 and I would say probably 35-40 full-time people so you are looking at \$2.5 million a year just to support that.

Mr. Fullenkamp: We are talking about this part-time/full-time and you are suggesting that part-time fire departments aren't going to succeed going forward without an increase in pay. Chief Stitzel: Right and that's one of the things I'm asking for is that we are wanting to do a significant and substantial increase in hourly pay for part-time people to help retain the ones that we have, try to do a hiring or recruitment blitz and try to get some people in. I saw this work just last year in Vandalia, they increased their pay and their paramedics are up to \$16.00 an hour as their top out. Go ahead and flip to the personnel, that's kind of telling us what we do. We are doing close to 4,900 calls and that an 11% increase right now. We do training almost every day, we are averaging almost 63 hours per firefighter and that's low.

We should be training more, but we get pulled away from training because of call volumes and a lot of other things. We are doing our daily fire inspections; re-inspections; pre-plans; plans review; public education; our school visits; public relations; standing by at the football games because we send a medic unit to each one of the high schools every Friday night during football season; our GROW program and Community Paramedicine program, which are really starting to take off and that's taken time out of our people's daily activities; hose testing and hydrant flushing and inspections; our apparatus equipment inventories; maintenance and cleaning, we wash our own vehicles; we mow the lawns; and we do all these things.

There are the administrative projects of inventory management, the quarter master, and things like that; health and wellness initiatives; policy review. We talked earlier about the administrative staff and our administrative assistants. Anne works part-time for me, part-time for Jay, and part-time for the City Manager. She is spread thin. I'm doing a lot of the administrative work that typically an Administrative Assistant would be doing. I do it myself because I don't have anybody else working Monday through Friday. We are doing the best we can and there are always these other duties and assignments that come up daily, so when I say that we need more people because

Thursday, November 30, 2017

we do 4,900 calls a year it's not just the calls it is all the other stuff that we have to do. There are days we run with 5-6 people a day and pretty much all we do is take calls. The inspections get canceled because we don't have enough people. If you figure we have five people working on a day, a car crash comes in and that's all five people. If a heart attack comes in, that's all five people. That's one EMS call and all five people are busy, so nothing else gets done while that's happening.

What we are looking at for the personnel part of the budget, I'm asking for an increase of one full-time person. I know that money is tight and we don't have a lot of it. I would love to ask just like the Police Chief said for 10 more people. I would love to do that, but I would like to do one this year and start a plan to where we are looking at maybe one next year and one the following year. If this is something that Council is interested in doing and looking at transitioning this department into more full-time, we can look at the Safer grants and get into that where we can have some cost savings, but after three years they are on our dime 100%. The reason that we didn't do the Safer grant last year is because the first two years we can make it work pretty well, but that third year would be very detrimental to my part-time budget and I would lose a lot of part-time people just to have those three full-time.

It takes three part-time to make one full-time because of how many hours that they are allowed to work under the Affordable Care Act. That's the other thing that really kind of hurt us because back before the Affordable Care Act put a limit on the number of hours a part-time person could work a lot more than they are now. Now it is averaging 30 hours a week and that's it. I actually just last week caught a couple of the guys that were getting over on the hours and I told them they were taking a shift off just so we are not in violation of that law, so we are actually pulling them back the ones that do want to work. The full-time increase of one person plus a 2% raise and that's kind of a guesstimate. Our contract negotiations are next year, but 2017 was at \$1.1 million and we are looking at going up to \$1,197,000.00 plus the rollups for insurance and all of that would be part of that one full-time person. That would help relieve the reliance on part-time staffing by having that one full-time person. The more full-time, the less part-time we would have or we would need.

Deputy Mayor Curp: I don't recall how we have laid out your personnel budget as far as the wages, whether we have a line for full-time and a line for part-time dollar amounts. Chief Stitzel: Yes. Deputy Mayor Curp: Is that how we have it laid out, dollar amounts? Chief Stitzel: Yes. Deputy Mayor Curp: Have you used all your part-time budget this year? Chief Stitzel: Not completely and I will tell you why. Deputy Mayor Curp: I want to know how much is left over right now roughly. Chief Stitzel: I don't have that right now. Mr. Carpenter: I can tell you what we project. We budgeted \$396,600.00 for part-time appropriated. We are forecasting that we are going to spend \$326,200.00. Part of the other side of that story is we appropriated \$35,500.00 in overtime and we are forecasting to spend \$59,500.00. Chief Stitzel: Some of that part-time money has moved into the overtime account to help offset that.

Deputy Mayor Curp: Where I'm going with it is if you had used more of that part-time money to balance and to increase the amount for the hourly wage that you pay the part-timers, you may not need the overtime and you could have attracted or kept the people that you have. Chief Stitzel: We didn't want to do that if we didn't think it was going to be sustainable. The amount of money that we had in the 2017 budget and providing those increases and everything if we were to run short before the end of the year, that was our concern of not having enough to maintain the raises. Deputy Mayor Curp: But you understand the opposite of that is now you are in here telling us that you need full-time people when that could have worked perhaps using the remaining monies in the part-time salary account, if you pay a little bit more and keep the part-timers. Chief Stitzel: Right and that is what we are wanting to do. I see your point if we would have done that earlier, but I don't know if that would offset a lot because right now I have two active applications on file to work here. The amount of increase that I am looking at for a part-time, like I said we were at \$12.06 an hour for a paramedic and I'm looking at going up to \$15.00 an hour for paramedics. If I did the math on the new rates, I'm not sure that we would have had enough to cover that and I was kind of concerned about going over budget. The plan has kind of been this

Thursday, November 30, 2017

whole time is to get through this and then address it in the 2018 budget. That's where I have been coming from with this. I see if we would have given the raises earlier and ate up what we had, we may not be in as bad of shape. I don't think we would have had enough to make it to the end of the year. Deputy Mayor Curp: I would have appropriated money.

Mr. Fullenkamp: So is \$15.00 for a part-time going to attract more people? Chief Stitzel: I think so, yes. Mr. Fullenkamp: I mean is that enough? Chief Stitzel: It is still not at the top of the range. Mr. Fullenkamp: This is starting or what is this? Chief Stitzel: What I have done there and I have a draft of what I want to do and I haven't put that out yet, depending on your certification if you are an EMT Basic the max you can make is \$14.00 an hour. If you are a paramedic, the max you can make is \$15.00 an hour. If you are in orientation or you are just a firefighter, and EMT Basic is going to start out at \$11.00-11.50 depending on your firefighter certification. Once you become a driver/operator and that means you are able to drive and operate the fire engine which takes a little bit of training to get to that point, you can get up to \$12.00 an hour as a Basic and \$14.00 as a paramedic. Mr. Fullenkamp: Currently. Chief Stitzel: No, this is under the 2018 plan for next year. Mr. Fullenkamp: I'm seeing \$15.00 an hour for paramedics. Chief Stitzel: For next year. Mr. Fullenkamp: And \$14.00 an hour for Basics for next year. Chief Stitzel: Yes, here's how you get to those numbers, you promise and you sign a document basically committing to work the maximum number of hours allowed by law. You are 24 hours every 6<sup>th</sup> day, which is the biggest benefit to me because I can count on that person being there and if I get two of them I can put them on separate days and they work the same shift. They can work like on the 1<sup>st</sup> Platoon and work one day on 1<sup>st</sup> Platoon and then the other works the next day on 1<sup>st</sup> Platoon and then he comes back on that day. That's like almost having a full-time person by getting two people to guarantee me they are going to do that instead of picking and choosing.

Mr. Fullenkamp: I don't want to get into the weeds too much I want to talk about numbers. You are saying that's about a \$30,000.00 cost to go from \$396,000.00 to \$428,000.00 for part-time employees with this raise in place. Chief Stitzel: Yes, with this raise in place I'm asking for \$428,000.00 for part-time. Mr. Fullenkamp: Is that enough? Is \$15.00 an hour with the commitment enough to attract part-timers to come in and work for the City of Riverside? Chief Stitzel: Yes, I believe it is. Mr. Fullenkamp: Are there people below us at that rate? Chief Stitzel: There are still some below us, yes, some of your smaller or rural that are combination volunteer part-time like your Bethel Township or New Carlisle. Vandalia is \$16.00 an hour, Washington Township is \$20.00 an hour, so I have looked at the different wages in the region and I tried to pick something somewhat in the middle to make us competitive.

The other point I want to make is with that \$428,000.00 and the \$15.00 an hour cannot get us to nine a day. Mr. Fullenkamp: What gets us there? Chief Stitzel: Probably \$114,000.00 more. Mr. Fullenkamp: You are saying \$114,000.00 more to part-timers? Chief Stitzel: On top of the \$428,000.00, if I can get another \$114,000.00 then that would be enough to staff all the hours up to nine people a day. Mr. Fullenkamp: At this rate? Chief Stitzel: At that rate, yes. What I'm doing now is averaging seven a day, by doing this I'm hoping to get to eight. Mrs. Lommatzsch: If you can hire the people. Chief Stitzel: If I can hire the people. Mr. Fullenkamp: If this wage is competitive, so you would need an additional \$80,000.00 over this \$30,000.00 increase to get to nine a day part-time staffing or shift. Chief Stitzel: \$114,000.00 on top of the \$428,000.00. Mr. Fullenkamp: So an additional. Chief Stitzel: You are looking at another 24 hours a day, seven days a week, 365 days a year. What I was figuring is an average would have been about \$14.50 an hour, so averaging that out because I work more EMT Basics than I do paramedics. Mr. Fullenkamp: So this would get you the right mix of paramedics and EMT Basics. Chief Stitzel: This should get me the right mix of people, the right mix of paramedics to get the part-time people in to get us up to where the staffing would be conducive to what we are doing.

Mrs. Reynolds: For a total of \$542,000.00 it gets you to the point that you have your nine personnel. Chief Stitzel: Nine people a day, combination of part-time and full-

Thursday, November 30, 2017

time, yes. Mrs. Reynolds: That cuts your overtime, it's an additional \$396,000.00 is what we've got now. Mr. Fullenkamp: It's an additional \$30,000.00 right now under the current plan. \$396,000.00 to \$428,000.00. Mayor Flaute: Would we still need that full-time person if you would do what they are talking about here? Chief Stitzel: If we did this and we got the full and I was thinking it was \$525,000.00 in the part-time wages, if we were to do that I would not be asking for the full-time person right now. I would do everything I could to get up to nine a day with part-time paying this wage.

Mayor Flaute: So it is cheaper to do what we are talking about than hiring another person. Chief Stitzel: It is, however, the problem of maintaining that part-time staff is still challenging because other departments that are paying \$16.00 an hour and \$20.00 an hour are still struggling to get part-timers to come in. Mrs. Reynolds: At that point Chief, why aren't you thinking about the market? Mrs. Lommatzsch: I like \$16.00 for paramedics. That's what Vandalia is paying. Mrs. Reynolds: There is no reason to continue beating around the bush. This is what we need. I can understand that. I can work with something like that, but when we are saying we don't know if we are going to be able to maintain it. Chief Stitzel: I'm trying to be frugal and not to ask for too much. Mr. Manager and I have talked about the deficit and how much money is available and I'm trying to figure out a way to do the best with that we have without asking for the world. Again, I would love to have another million.

Mrs. Lommatzsch: Is there anything wrong with going to \$16.00 for paramedics and \$14.00 for basics? You have a \$1.00 difference between paramedics and basics. If paramedics are getting \$16.00 in Vandalia, can we do \$16.00 for paramedics and \$14.00 for an EMT? Chief Stitzel: We can. Mrs. Lommatzsch: We can do whatever we want, I understand that. What I'm saying is does that help your resource pool? Chief Stitzel: Yes, the more we pay the more likely it is that you are going to get people to come in. They are going to come in and I'm going to be looking towards other full-time Fire Departments and say on their days off, why don't they come work for us part-time. That was I don't lose them to others. The ones we hire right now, as soon as they get their paramedic card they go to a full-time job. They are always looking for a full-time job. Every part-time firefighter I know has the same goal to be full-time.

Mayor Flaute: I guess I think what I'm hearing is maybe we should not do the full-time and do the part-time. Mrs. Reynolds: You need \$146,000.00. Chief Stitzel: Above what I have. Mr. Fullenkamp: Minus the cost of the full-timer. Chief Stitzel: If you take that person out, which is \$90,000.00 for a full-time person, essentially what I'm asking for from my part-time to get up to nine a day and be able to staff nine a day is about \$525,000.00. Mayor Flaute: And you've got \$428,000.00 in here now. Chief Stitzel: I've got \$396,000.00 this year, \$428,000.00 for my next year ask. Deputy Mayor Curp: If you fund it at that level then you also reduce the overtime. Chief Stitzel: If you go down underneath this because we talked about the hourly wage for paramedics, EMT Basics, the Incentive Program, and try to increase that current pool to part-time to improve maximum staffing to nine. Right after that I'm also saying in 2018 reduce my overtime down to \$20,000.00 and that puts \$15,000.00 up into part-time. We can do that. There are going to be times I'm going to need overtime. I'm sure that until we get up to strength. Mrs. Lommatzsch: Sparky's. Chief Stitzel: Yes, there are times I will need overtime. Whenever an Officer or a Battalion Chief is off or if I have both Officers off for some reason and right now I'm short a Battalion Chief, there is overtime every time that Lieutenant takes off.

Mr. Fullenkamp: As long as you think you can make part-time and you can make it work. Mayor Flaute: Even if you raise the price and can't get the bodies. Chief Stitzel: I can make it attractive to the market. Mr. Fullenkamp: If they aren't coming here because we aren't paying enough, here's your sign. Chief Stitzel: I want to back up real quick; I said that \$525,000.00 based on \$15.00 an hour, so if we are wanting to do \$16.00 an hour I may need to rework some additional dollars. Mr. Denning: Before you do \$16.00 do \$17.00 and then we will pull some of those from Vandalia. Mayor Flaute: No, no, no. You decide what you think is the right thing to do. Mrs. Reynolds: That's the name of the game, if that's where you want to be. Mr. Denning: Overall if it's going to decrease our costs because we are not going to have the full-timers then use \$17.00 an hour. I don't have a problem with that.

Thursday, November 30, 2017

Chief Stitzel: I can send you the numbers tomorrow morning. Mr. Denning: Send us the numbers because it is going to increase your pool. We are not Centerville, so we are not going to pay \$20.00. Chief Stitzel: They are on the high end, I will give them that. \$15.00-17.00 does seem to be about the average. Mr. Denning: Some of our guys left here to go to Vandalia because they were paying more. Why can't we do the same thing? That's how they did it, they increased the budget. If \$1.00 an hour from what they are is going to help us get them back then go \$16.50, I don't care. Mr. Fullenkamp: Run those numbers for all three of these salaries and give us the numbers for the full-time minus current and just run all those numbers for us and we will help you make the decision. Chief Stitzel: Outstanding.

Mr. Smith: You say you want to hire a full-time firefighter, now is that per shift or just one? Chief Stitzel: My request was just for one right now and they would be assigned to one shift and that shift would be less reliant on part-time people. Mr. Smith: The cost of full-time firefighter/paramedic with benefits is \$90,000.00? Chief Stitzel: It's about \$97,000.00 with the benefits. Mr. Smith: So you have \$97,000.00 with benefits, if you took that \$97,000.00 and divided it by three you could get three part-timers out of that which would be one full-time equivalent. Chief Stitzel: Pretty much. Mr. Smith: We've had this problem before years ago. I wanted to bring on another firefighter and the Fire Chief said it just wouldn't work because we have three shifts and to bring on one you really need to bring on three. What he did is used the money for one and did three part-time to do the equivalent. Chief Stitzel: It's nice to have the shifts balance out and they all have an equal number of full-time people on each shift, but there is nothing that says that it has to be that way. I can have six on one shift and five on the other two. I'm just looking at trying to get ahead. My forecast if this doesn't work and if the part-time people just aren't going to be out there then we might have to look at increasing our full-time staffing over the next five years or so.

Mr. Smith: In reference to the wage for the EMT versus the paramedic, you only have \$1.00 right now is what you are predicting. That's not much incentive to go forward and become a paramedic. Chief Stitzel: They is going to be incentive and most of them are going out there and getting their paramedic certification not to get that \$1.00 an hour, but to get a full-time job somewhere else. Mr. Smith: Right. Chief Stitzel: That's their incentive. Mr. Smith: That's what we want, we want the paramedic. Mayor Flaute: I think you know what Council needs and you figure out whether it is \$15.00 or \$16.00.

Chief Stitzel: Something I just want to throw out there real quick we are getting \$20,000.00 a year right now from the Environmental Protection Agency that goes towards the Community Paramedicine Program and that money is going into the part-time budget. There is \$20,000.00 of that we hope to sustain with that. Mr. Smith: How long can we expect to get that \$20,000.00 from the EPA? Is that going to be ongoing or is that just right now? Chief Stitzel: Right now it is guaranteed for one year. It is in four \$5,000.00 quarterly installments that we will get from Outreach Montgomery County because they got the grant and they are giving us \$20,000.00 of that grant to provide our personnel to help with the program. Mr. Denning: As long as they keep getting the grant, we will keep getting paid. Chief Stitzel: Yes.

My operating budget, again there is a 4% reduction in the operating expenses which was \$16,386.00 that I had to take out of operating. Keeping in mind that there is going to be a 10-15% increase in calls, which when you have an increase in call volume there is going to be an increase in spending. What you are seeing there the color code if you look down the note side there, there are the parts where it seemed we did not spend all of it in 2017 and that's where I reduced it out of to meet the reduction. I do want to reactivate my Fire Tools and Equipment line item. There would be no additional monies; we are just taking money out of the other operating lines and putting them in that so we can more accurately track our spending. That's just a couple house cleaning issues there.

EMS Billing Fees, EMS Refunds, and Dispatch/Radio, all of those are expected to go up because the call volume goes up. The Contracted Services 5289 we are doing an increase in there because of the new EMS software that we purchased at the

Thursday, November 30, 2017

beginning of this year. It came out of Capital and now it is \$10,000.00 from now on as long as we stick with that software, so that had to go up. Taking the \$16,000.00 out of the operating, I really trimmed down a lot of areas just to kind of support all of these other areas we had to go up in. Everything else is pretty close to the same as this past year. Mayor Flaute: We like to see reduce. Chief Stitzel: We are doing what we can as far as keeping those purse strings as tight as we can. We don't want to waste it obviously.

For Capital Projects, we are due for a new medic unit. We try to replace a medic every 2-3 years. This was actually on the plan for last year and we took it off the plan because we had the two new fire engines and we were trying to push this out to the third year. We are wanting to replace Medic 105. It is a 2007 with 110,000 miles on it. It is currently sitting at Beau Townsend Ford. We are having a very tough time finding a power train control module. They don't make them anymore and we are trying to find one off of a used. We are looking on Ebay. We are trying to find a power control module to fix this thing so we can get it back in service. My Medic 7 is out of service at Station 6 with a massive oil leak. That is going to cost \$8,000.00 to fix that. I told my Battalion Chief of Maintenance to get it into Interstate Ford next week to get the repairs started and we will have to pay that in January. There is a need for a new medic; I really need one. I feel terrible asking about this after all this part-time money talk. We are looking at \$185,000.00 is the approximate cost of a new medic. It is just due. I have a total of four medics, but tomorrow for about an hour, I will be down to one because I have two of them that are broken. I've got two in service and two that need to go in for service so we don't blow that motor up. I wish I could tell you I could make this old medic last another year, but having an advance life support medic unit with 110,000 miles on it is just not good decision making and it is not reliable.

Mayor Flaute: Are you going to put the \$8,000.00? Chief Stitzel: That's for Medic 7 which isn't going to go away. Medic 105 is at Beau Townsend and we can't fix it because we can't find the control module. We don't even know how much that is going to cost to repair, so we are telling he finds it to give us an idea how much it is going to cost because we may say no. We may say not to fix it and just tow it back. There is that, I am asking for a medic.

Some of the other things that I just want to say they are there and are things we would really like to see if there is any Capital money available: The power cots. We would like to transition to the power cots to prevent back injuries and injuries to our patients in case a cot is dropped. It takes out all the heavy lifting by having these hydraulic powered cots. They are fairly expensive, you are looking at \$92,000.00 to buy two of them and we are only looking to get two because with two you get the maximum BWC grant of \$40,000.00. Our cost would be \$52,000.00 and BWC will give us \$40,000.00 towards those. Again it is \$52,000.00 out of our pockets and that is only going to equip my hopefully new medic and my next best medic. The other two backup medics would still have the old manual cots until we can get those transitioned into power cots.

We would love to replace some worn and broken PT equipment at the fire stations. Police and Fire personnel use the treadmill, elliptical, the weight machines, and things like that. Again health and wellness is just a big agenda item of mine as Chief and I'm really hoping to be able to do something to improve that aspect of it. I spoke with Chief Robinson from the Police Department and he said if we wanted to split the cost of \$17,000.00, you could put half in his budget and half in my budget to go together to buy some workout equipment.

The other thing that really isn't part of the Capital plan, but we have discussed this previously and I didn't get any objections so we are moving forward and declared Engine 105 surplus and we are advertising it right now to sell it. We also have a need for a new vehicle, a command vehicle. What we are hoping to do is sell that old fire engine for enough money to buy a new vehicle to completely cover that new vehicle. That is the plan is to sell this fire engine and buy this vehicle. Then the oldest vehicle that we have in our fleet that is just no longer reliable as an emergency vehicle. There is just too much of a possibility of it breaking down on the way to an emergency

Thursday, November 30, 2017

call and we just don't want it to go there. Mr. Smith: Has City Council deemed that engine surplus? Chief Stitzel: Yes, it was surplus by resolution and it is currently on GovDeals and advertised for sale. Mr. Smith: Okay, I just didn't remember that. Chief Stitzel: Yes, we did do that. Again when we discussed that in Council about selling Engine 105, this is what I was explaining that I want to sell it and buy a new command vehicle for our Incident Commanders and for our Battalion Chiefs. Their vehicle would move down and my vehicle would move down and the other vehicle we have can either be traded in, we could sell it, or we could give it to another department that might need a vehicle so they don't have to buy one; something that is a non-emergency type use. We have options and if it saves money by giving it to Zoning, we can do that. If not and we want to sell it or trade it in we can. That's just out there.

We have a generator at Station 6 that needs some maintenance done to it and I just put that in the Capital. If we can get extra money for that, if not we will do our best to nurse it along.

Mr. Smith: I'm looking at the costs we are going to incur for a new medic and you know we replace these things every several years and we just did two fire trucks for a little over \$1 million. I was looking at your budget here and I don't see where you have been putting any money back for capital improvements or capital replacements. Chief Stitzel: Well the budget that you see there is operating. My capital budget that I had for this year, we pretty much spent it all on projects that were approved a year ago when Mr. Manager was the Fire Chief. We had an SCBA upgrade project. We saw those through and those were all completed. We saved a few \$100.00 on some rebates from DP&L and things like that, but there is less than \$1,000.00 in the capital to carry over to next year. At the end of the budget year, whatever money is left over goes back into the General Fund.

Mayor Flaute: It sounds like the operating and the medic you are going to need. It sounds like you are doing about everything you can. The only thing is the personnel and we had that discussion. Chief Stitzel: We are taking a whole new look at grants. We just got a grant from BWC for our protective hoods and gloves. We got \$14,900.00 worth of hoods and gloves and it cost us \$2,300.00. We are looking at firehouse sub grants to get some external chest compressors. We are looking at BWC for the power cots. We are looking at another grant and as soon as it comes out if we can get a grant for the medic, we will certainly apply for that. I told my Chiefs that we need to take advantage of every possible grant that is out there, so they are researching all grant possibilities. Mayor Flaute: That's what you have to do.

Mr. Smith: We just recently bought some turnout gear, didn't we? Chief Stitzel: What we did the other day was approve a financing of turnout gear and we got the paperwork in today and we will get it signed next week so we can get it off. It is no additional money to the operating budget, how much money is in that Protective line item stays. What that does is prevent us from having to pay the increase in costs over the next five years because every year the cost of gear goes up. We are going to buy 25 sets in early 2018 and what that will do is give every full-time firefighter two sets of gear and every part-time firefighter will have a good set, plus a backup set that they can share in case they go out on a fire at 9:00 a.m. they can come back and have clean gear to change into that's not covered in carcinogens and all that other stuff.

Mr. Smith: That was my next question. I understand they have new gear now that prevents the carcinogens in the fire and smoke from being absorbed into the body or inhaled. Chief Stitzel: That came out maybe three years ago. We can't afford to get rid of all that old stuff, but it is going to go into backup status. Mr. Smith: The new stuff that we are looking to buy. Chief Stitzel: It has all the carcinogen protections in the turnout gear, plus all those hoods that we just got. We are buying 85 hoods with that BWC grant money. That hoods that we wear right now are \$20.00 a piece; these new hoods are \$85.00 a piece and they protect us from the carcinogen particulates so they won't get into our skin and stuff and the same with the gloves. We are making a huge leap forward in protecting our firefighters. My philosophy is there is

Thursday, November 30, 2017

really only one thing that I keep on this fire department for 30 years and that's my firefighters, everything else goes away, but for 30 years we have firefighters and we need to protect them the best we can. I kind of put a lot of my effort into this cancer awareness prevention, the turnout gear, the hoods, the BWC grants and all of that.

Mrs. Reynolds: Chief, I appreciate and commend you on your budget. It gave us the information we need and I appreciate that. Have you looked at any ways to increase revenues coming in to the Fire Department? Chief Stitzel: Our EMS Billing is about the only way that we have the ability to increase revenues other than our ESO software has made some improvements as far as our billing efforts and getting the EMS calls through our billing company. We have discussed and kind of looked into taking a little more of a stance on hard billing and hard billing our non-residents that we transport and things like that. Other than going out and figuring out how to generate more EMS calls, I don't know how. Mayor Flaute: Unless we redo that 1979 levy. Chief Stitzel: Fire levies and income tax. I don't know how else to generate more revenue out of the Fire Department. Our mutual aid calls are dropping which means our revenue may drop a little bit also because of that. Mayor Flaute: Maybe we ought to look at that 1979 levy again. Mr. Smith: I think we need to look at the levy because people will approve a fire levy. Mayor Flaute: People will see 1979 and now we need something. Maybe that is something we ought to consider depending on what we are going to do. We don't want to put too many things on there. Mr. Smith: It's a 38 year old levy. Mr. Carpenter: I think that will be included in our look of the financial review when we will look at everything.

There were no additional questions or comments.

#### D) 2018 Budget – Service Department

Mayor Flaute: Do we need a break? If we've got a private conversation going on back there and we either need a break or you guys leave the room please. Thank you. Do we need a break or are we going to keep on rolling? Mrs. Reynolds: How long is the Service Department going to take? Mr. Keaton: Maybe five minutes. Mayor Flaute: Steve and Chief, would you guys please leave the room? Please.

Mr. Keaton: First of all, thank you all for allowing me to stand up here tonight. I really wasn't planning on being here not to awful long ago, but I will do the best I can to fill in and to give you what I know about what we are doing and what is going on. Thank you as well for the recent investments that you guys have made in the Public Service Department with the equipment. We do appreciate that and it has helped us out tremendously in our efforts and in the things that we do. We really do appreciate that. I have been here almost 30 years and I think some of you guys have been here almost as long as me. We will make it through these tough times. I listen to the departments and it brings back old memories and we always make it and we will going forward. When I met with Mark and we started discussing these things, I know this is a wish list. There are also some things I would like to throw out there for you to consider. These aren't necessarily things that we have to live and die by, but these are things that are on our wish list or things we do need. We can live without, but there are some things that need to be addressed within this thing.

Some of the things that we are doing to let you now in case you have not been told because I do want you to be fully aware of some of the things that we are trying. We do lean heavily on some of our neighbors, Fairborn, Beavercreek, and Dayton. Dayton has been very good to us as far as saving us money in our department, especially on our dumping fees. They are letting us use their yard for nothing. We can take our debris over there and dump for nothing. I don't know if you guys know this or not. Anything that I pick up off the street, I can take to Dayton without having to take that to the incinerator and be charged for these things and don't have to pay any dumping fees at any other dump sites or landfills. That's a great thing they have done for us. You guys probably know that we set up kind of a regional share in how we deice, so that we aren't driving over their streets and they aren't driving over ours and everybody is lifting their plows and turning the salt on and off. We did do that.

Thursday, November 30, 2017

Salt storage helped us out a lot. I made a deal with Fred Stovall. I don't think I have any friends I haven't used yet, but I made a deal with Fred Stovall in Dayton where we could store our 500 tons over there this year. We filled up our salt bin this year with the salt money that we saved, so we have 1,000 tons available to us without maybe even having to touch next year's salt budget. That was very kind of them to allow us to do that and that was all in this year's budget. Other things we are doing is working with the schools a lot trying to make deals with the schools about using equipment. We also work share a little bit and will sweep some of their lots when the sweeper is running. We will do those kinds of things.

In Fairborn, I met with the fella that is their Operations Manager over there. We were talking about work exchanges for equipment that we don't have and they have plenty of. We have more knowledge than their men, so we have been doing a lot of training with other departments and I don't know if you guys know that. In the City of Dayton, we went over there and trained some of their folks on the dura-patcher and how to maintain that equipment, etc. Fairborn was kind of the same thing and they will exchange some of that little bit of knowledge info that we have for manpower, to come and bring equipment over, and help us do some mill and fill, things of that nature. Just as kind of an introduction to us that you might not know. We are using heavily the Prisoner Work Program and they are picking up for us hundreds of bags of trash every few months. That's helps us out a lot walking the corridors, especially on Harshman, Woodman, 35, and Route 4. I've worked with the schools in the past with troubled kids at Stebbins High School. It didn't work out too well, but we tried. We worked with Youth Works and tried that out. It didn't work out too great, but we tried. We are always looking, but we are always thankful as well for what you all have done for us. I wanted to just kind of throw that out there first of all.

The first slide is the street sweeper. The thing is a mechanical sweeper, so it has a trillion working parts on this thing. It's got a conveyor system. When you guys see us go by, we lower these gutter brooms down and it is sweeping the debris off the gutter plate up underneath the sweeper, which then gets on the conveyor system and is dumped in a hopper. In the course of doing all of that there are all kinds of parts working together, this unit is I believe a 2004. It was a used unit when we got it; it was a demo unit. We can run it, but it just kind of varies. Sometimes I can get a day's use out of it and sometimes I don't. I've been planning my use for the street sweeper based on whether or not my vehicle maintenance and equipment maintenance line item is bolstered enough to handle it or not. It's a great tool in our department. We don't just sweep streets with it. It's used for glass cleanups when accidents happen, spills across the city that happen, chemicals used by the Fire Department and we come and sweep that up. If there are areas with catch basins that are clogged up, we can open those things up by getting into the gutter plate and then the opening of the catch basin. It is a tool we use for a lot of different functions that is very important to us.

The new sweeper capability we put \$300,000.00 on here. That's a lot of money and I know it. I wanted to give up because I know this is terrible, but these things are incredibly expensive. This sweeper would have a vac capability which OEPA likes to see us have. This thing would be able to suck up the particulates up off the ground. You can use it for things like in a mill and fill and we are going along and patch an area right here, we are going to mill down below street level. These brooms cannot capture that stuff that sits down below street level, but a vac system can and it can pull that stuff up and that way we are not shoveling and racking and throwing stuff in the back of a truck. If he just comes by and sweeps this debris up, it makes us much more efficient and effective doing that kind of work like that. Also catch basin cleaning, the ability to have a vac on the backside of that truck with the massive flooding problems that we have. It came in handy just recently with all the rain storms that we had. We had several areas that were flooding in the Brantwood Phase I. The culvert plugged up right there off of Brandt Pike and had probably three feet of debris on it. It began running over the side of the curb running down Reading Road and ran all the way down and flooded the whole street. You could canoe down that whole street. My point being with a vac system, you can suck debris up rather than digging debris with a backhoe when you are especially close to infrastructure that could kill you if you hit it. One of the things we use the street sweeper for that has a vac

Thursday, November 30, 2017

capability like we have had in the past is when we are digging and we are getting close to infrastructure and we are in the road, we will vac that stuff out before we stick a shovel or a man down in there or the backhoe to try to dig around this infrastructure because it could be dangerous. There are high pressure water mains and high pressure gas mains.

It costs us roughly over \$20,000.00 for the last several years in maintenance costs on this vehicle or this piece of equipment. It's fantastic. We preventative maintenance the crud out of this thing, but it has just got so much to it that can break down and once it is broken down it is just done and setting there. It is a valuable tool in our tool box for the many things we do within our department. Are there any questions?

Mr. Smith: You have finance \$100,000.00 over three years. Is that supposed to be \$300,000.00? Mayor Flaute: It would be \$100,000.00 times three. Mr. Keaton: We threw out a number not to exceed and without knowing how to finance yet and without knowing if you would want to approve this. We know this was a wish list kind of thing. Mr. Denning: When you look at it, that's only \$75,000.00 a year because you are spending \$25,000.00 a year on repairs already. Mr. Carpenter: That's a good point. Mrs. Lommatzsch: There will still be maintenance to be had. Mr. Denning: There will still be some maintenance, but it won't be nearly that high. I would assume buying a brand new one, you would have a certain amount of warranty time. I have nothing against it. This one has lasted us quite a long time, so if we have to get a used model of some sort. Mr. Keaton: We are grateful for anything. Mr. Denning: If we could get it for \$200,000.00 instead of \$300,000.00.

Mr. Keaton: If I can keep a guy in this thing all the time, I would because it is so valuable to us. I had a goal this past year of getting every catch basin and this sounds crazy because we have thousands of catch basins in the city, but to have every catch basin cleaned in the city. We accomplished that goal just kind of keeping this thing rigged together and the vac truck as well. We accomplished that and it has saved us. Some of these big rains, we had no calls whatsoever. We accomplished that by keeping this thing up as best as we can and with preventative maintenance galore on it. We have been keeping it going by investing money into it as well as the vac truck that goes hand in hand with this piece of machinery. It is valuable to us in our department.

I could probably keep a guy in this all the time. A goal that I had was to sweep the whole city once and that includes the main drags, so we swept both sides of every street one time this year and every plat street and every main drag. I will put them out overnight and will schedule them overnight work to do the wall. You will see us out and I will call them the pork chop islands, the little concrete islands at all the intersection, we will clean them all out. It is really important to do that. I know it sounds like a trivial affair, but with the way that we salt and the way that we use our chemicals for de-icing that stuff is the archenemy of concrete and when it begins to permeate into that concrete, it starts busting it loose and you guys see it out here all the time and you need to be able to sweep that stuff up. That's what we use this piece of equipment for. The grass growing in the streets and you see that all over. If you are able to sweep the streets more often that staves that off and that's how a lot of communities keep that from happening because they are sweeping and cleaning a lot and they are also chemical treating that stuff, but it will help stave some of that off. Aesthetics mean a lot around here.

Mayor Flaute: We have had trouble with that sweeper from the get go, so it is probably time. Mr. Keaton: Just to throw this out there for you all, it is a piece of equipment and I know we are in financial crisis mode kind of. I'm aware of that and you are looking at the guy that is used to no help, so I appreciate anything you do for me.

Mr. Smith: I have a question about the street sweeper itself. If you are sitting inside the street sweeper and you are running down the street sweeping, does it create a lot of dust inside and is the driver inhaling all that dirt and dust? Mr. Keaton: You keep the windows rolled up and you have air conditioning in the summertime. In the wintertime you have the windows rolled up. The inside of the cab has air filters on it

Thursday, November 30, 2017

to keep that from happening. We maintenance those filters all the time to keep him breathing good. It's got a watering system on it. In the wintertime we go along and get it winterized so it doesn't freeze up and so the water pumps and tanks don't freeze up the water lines. It will be a little more dusty for wintertime operation, but we've got water that sprays out that kind of dampens the ground and keeps the dust down. It is still a dust bowl, but he is able to keep the windows rolled up and air conditioning on and that whole cab is filtered. I told you I'm going to be real easy. Mayor Flaute: It sounds like you need to do something with that.

Mr. Keaton: The Five Year Street Paving Plan, I talked with Mark about this and we need a plan. Even though we are working on our 20-Year Paving Plan and we are trying to do some, we need to follow a process about what we are doing. Everybody around us demands it from us if we are going to get stuff right and not keep paving over streets that have water main breaks that happen and they tear all of your pavement up. I've been an advocate of this for a very long time. In talking with Mark, I set up a meeting with the County and Ed Schlack and we sat down and had a very good meeting and this is where these roads all come from is a result of that meeting I had over there. I have talked to AT&T.

The Five Year Paving Plan was birthed out of that desire to have a vision because I believe without a vision you perish. We started looking at streets and how you pick the streets when they are all scoring the same? We took a look at this and I have a very intimate knowledge of all the streets and plats and residential areas in the City and I know which ones are more critical mass and which ones are water main and sanitary problems. We set up a meeting with Ed Schlack down at the County and the City Manager went. He was able to put up a nice PowerPoint and I asked Ed if he could show us the most problematic areas that he has in Riverside of areas that he would like to replace these sanitary lines and these water lines, etc. When he popped it up, it starts at year three when you are looking at Bayside from Woodman to Olentangy, Gramercy and Orinoco. These were just littered with water main breaks in the past in areas that they would like to replace their pipes.

The benefit to this as we were sitting there talking to him and I knew that one of the reasons I stayed in the north area, if you would like to know this, is simply because we have so many water main breaks in the south and we are kind of at less risk to have our pavement disrupted that we are putting down here in some of the northern areas. When he popped up our northern list here he said he thinks that's an excellent selection that we have made because we have had one in the last 10 years. Our soft shoulder there, which we knew this, we are not replacing a lot of driveways, we are not doing curbs, and this is based on what we have been doing lately and the thought of \$5,000.00 a year and maximizing what we are putting down for people to drive on without getting into a lot of infrastructure. On that third year, the thought behind that is giving them time enough to plan and to budget for the replacement of water main or sanitary main lines from those destinations that I listed up here on the screen.

The benefit of that to us as you all know we are not going to have these water main breaks. We put pavement down and boom, it busts out and they have dug a gigantic hole in this. Having everybody at the table before we do these paving plans, I wanted everybody to have a seat at that table, AT&T, Vectren, Montgomery County, and anybody that could have telecommunication lines or any kind of lines going underneath our street. What is their projected plans for five years? Are they going to Harshman north? Are they going to dig right down the middle of the street, AT&T, because you sensed we put down new pavement? That's the idea behind this Five Year Paving Plan. I know that Choice One and I have run this by Jeff at Choice One, he likes this idea. Also with these three streets, they go from a mill and fill to a reconstruction. The interesting thing about this is Montgomery County puts up money towards restoration once they dig the crud out of your street to replace the piping that needs to be replaced. They also put money toward restoration of that street, so it lowers our cost to put the pavement back. It's helping us in both ways. Did I catch that right from them? That is what I heard Ed tell me. Mr. Carpenter: That's it.

Thursday, November 30, 2017

Mr. Keaton: That's our thought behind this. On the notes here one thing if you look at Bushnell, Bushnell actually scored and I developed this rating range just based on my knowledge and experience in pavement. 0-39 is a total reconstruction, 40-59 is a mill and fill, 60-85 is a micro surface, and 86-100 is a crack seal. My thought is Bushnell which is in this area to be paved and these would be overlays, one of the things we are finding out when we are doing our core sampling is the roads are so old and getting so rattled and decayed that there is no base left underneath, so to mill would be getting us down into dirt and strata that wouldn't hold up underneath the cars. You would end up with a Burkhardt Road where it is breaking up all the time. It drives me crazy. What I can do to help that and I rated that road and that road fell to a total reconstruct because a lot of the areas that had the inverted speed bumps where you are getting some base failure from tap ins to sanitary lines that people have had over the years, I would install a leveling coarse over that and call that out in the paving program. Put an intermediate coarse over there that would stave off the inverted speed bumps that we have when we drive down these streets and that would bring that up to a mill and fill and then we can overlay that and put a Sammy coarse down and overlay that just like we did with Prince Albert and just like we did Rohrer Boulevard as well as Poppa and Tica. That's the reason why you see a total reconstruct in this plan, just in case you caught that. That scored a 36. Are there any questions so far? You all look tired and I'm glad because where on those guys before me and that was great. Mayor Flaute: I'm still worried about your pick-up trucks.

Deputy Mayor Curp: The last meeting we had the County Administrator and his Lieutenant from Water & Sewer regarding all of their infrastructure and raising their rates in order to replace all that sort of stuff. When you were having your meeting with your guy that the County, how much of their stuff is in alignment with the Water & Sewer? Mr. Keaton: That's exactly who we were talking to. Are you talking just water and sewer itself? Deputy Mayor Curp: How much as far as storm water is our responsibility? Mr. Keaton: Storm water is ours, yes. How much is in the way that they would have to replace some of that? Is that what you are saying? Deputy Mayor Curp: I just want to make sure that we are talking to the people that we need to be talking to because I'm like you, I don't want us to go out and do something and come back and tear up the streets later. Mr. Keaton: Yes, sir.

Deputy Mayor Curp: I also have a concern about what we are going to do about the rest of the community because this is not enough money, it is not enough coverage, and what is going to happen in some of the other neighborhoods is that those streets that are already in bad shape and rate higher on the Choice One plan than these streets do and now they get pushed back even further. Those are going to deteriorate even more and it is going to cost people a lot of property values. I'm not supportive of that. I think we have to take a look at those other neighborhoods. Mr. Keaton: What I was hoping and that's a good point is when me and Mark were talking, we kind of talked about that very thing and I know that in my limited knowledge of what you have talked about in a 20-Year Paving Plan, I'm hoping that somewhere within this that we have developed that. That then can start being dealt with as we invoke this 20-Year Paving Plan. Deputy Mayor Curp: According to the Choice One plan, some of those need to be dealt with now and those aren't on here.

Mrs. Reynolds: I thought the decision was made to stay in one community so you could move from community to community and that would be your work pattern. Mr. Keaton: Absolutely. That does this as well here in Rohrer. What you will end up with if you skip around a lot and one of the reasons like Mr. Curp said, there are some streets like Charlwood and in areas and some other streets in the south that could use this. Deputy Mayor Curp: Forest Ridge Boulevard. Mr. Keaton: Forest Ridge Boulevard and some of these areas even though they need to be paved are also areas where we have had a few water main breaks or we might have issues with other infrastructure perhaps and maybe Forest Ridge isn't one of them. One of the thought processes behind my deciding this was lowering the risk factor. If we go down and do Charlwood, can I dura-patch that and bolster up our material money in our Construction Material Maintenance line item and do a little dura-patching to keep these things band-aided and move on to a more permanent fix while we are doing these. It is a great point.

Thursday, November 30, 2017

Deputy Mayor Curp: Dura-patch creates an adverse impact on property value because those streets just open up again, those cracks open up again. Mr. Keaton: They do. The idea behind it is when you have a lot of alligating in an area that is beyond crack seal and it turns into an alligator cracking and you've got spider web cracking and it is too much to crack seal or too much to just throw pavement over, that emulsion is developed to settle that area for a limited amount of time. It is not going to solve the cracking and I will tell you all this, there is no product, and don't let Choice One or anybody tell us any different, there is no product out there that will not crack; no concrete material and no asphalt material. It will crack. That's the bottom line in that industry. Mr. Carpenter: The challenge with the plan is we could start anywhere in the City, so we looked at because of our limited financial dollars toward street paving we tried to find the ones Jay touched on that didn't have a lot of curb or gutter and these were more overlays. They are more affordable right now. We all realize going forward we need to address our street problem. As part of my presentation we are going to talk about our financial picture and get some advice and maybe find ways to get additional funds to address our problem because I wouldn't like if my street wasn't on the schedule until 20 years down the pike. Deputy Mayor Curp: It won't make it. Mr. Carpenter: Exactly. It won't make it and I'm not going to like it. Mayor Flaute: I guess I don't understand too, these like Mr. Curp said are different than Choice One. You guys maybe need to get together. Mr. Carpenter: All of these were rated mill and fill. Deputy Mayor Curp: But they weren't rated this early in the cycle. Mr. Carpenter: True.

Deputy Mayor Curp: The ones that we paved last year were not high on the cycle they were well down in the cycle. I know why we paved them, but it wasn't the right reason in my estimation. I don't recall us making any conscious decision to stay in one neighborhood. I know we talked about doing some paving in multiple neighborhoods in order for residents in those neighborhoods to see that they were getting some attention from the City also and tax dollars were being spent on improving their part of the community. We received a memo from Mr. Keaton saying one of the issues is that when the contractor moves their gear from one place to another there can be an upcharge if that is not already calculated in their quotes to us when we tell them the scope of the work, so we ended up doing what we did. That doesn't change anything in that there are a lot of neighborhoods that have streets higher up in the pecking order as laid out by Choice One and that is our Street Plan, at least I thought it was and that's why we spent all that money to have them go through and do all that work. If we are just going to ignore it then let's take Choice One out of all these budget areas whether it is in Mr. Taylor's area or wherever because we are wasting our time and money. The same thing with other consultants, if we are going to bring them in and ignore them. Mrs. Reynolds: That was the first thing that came to us and then it came to us that we were going to do communities by communities by communities. We are just here there and beyond. Mr. Carpenter: I don't believe Choice One said to go from the lowest score to the highest score. If that is the case then everything is a reconstruction and that's maybe one street.

Deputy Mayor Curp: The choice is ours. They established where the critical areas where and ranked the streets by critical need. That was my assumption. Mr. Keaton: Correct. Mr. Carpenter: In groupings also. Deputy Mayor Curp: These streets and the streets we paved last year were not up there in the top 10. Mr. Keaton: Right. Mr. Carpenter: The top 10 would be reconstructions. Deputy Mayor Curp: There were others that weren't reconstructions. Mr. Keaton: I have the list in front of me. Deputy Mayor Curp: It doesn't matter, you understand the point I'm trying to make. Mr. Keaton: In saying that, let me explain a little bit. On the streets that are on that critical list, and I don't have that with me right now, but as Mark said in meeting with Choice One and how to spend this \$500,000.00 per year even if they quote us and say we do two streets in Forest Ridge and then we do two streets in Avondale and we do two streets in Saville, they are still charging us for moving around. That \$2,000.00-3,000.00 will be in that quote, so it will be money that we could have put in one community and that \$2,000.00-3,000.00 has just turned into \$10,000.00 that could have been put in pavement by staying in one place.

The other thing is roads like Lynnhaven that are in critical, critical condition, once we do that road \$500,000.00 probably wouldn't do half of that road. I'm working with a

Thursday, November 30, 2017

budget number that is what it is. Our budget doesn't match what our needs are, so I'm working with a number and trying to maximize the number and maximize the pavement that I'm putting down with the budget number that I have which is \$500,000.00. Mayor Flaute: I think you need to get with Choice One and get this figured out. Mr. Denning: And having the County come in afterwards and putting in water lines after the fact.

Mr. Keaton: I did work with Choice One on this and I have been in close contact with Jeff and Casey in this and the choices of these roads. This wasn't just a pick from the air. This was from Choice One saying yes we've got this list, but you should stay where you are safe, your investment is safe, and maximize the dollars that you have and you are budgeted and put that as much in pavement and driving surface as you can. Unfortunately as Mr. Curp stated that doesn't necessarily line up with the needs that we have. Deputy Mayor Curp: The other thing is Choice One doesn't have to deal with trying to find the revenue to pay for this stuff and we do. We are going to have to come up with new revenue to do this because when you are operating in the red and you have all this stuff that needs to be done, you have to get new revenue from someplace. It's very difficult to go to neighborhoods that have their streets deteriorating states and ask them for money when they don't see anything happening to their streets and their streets aren't up there. They are prone to not vote yes on a tax issue.

Mr. Keaton: I can approach this anyway Council would like. I can do it anyway that you would like to do it. Mr. Carpenter: I think also this plan is today's Five-Year Plan. Next year we may come back and do some adjusting as well if there is another area that has a rash of water main breaks or if there is new revenue, that's a game changer. Deputy Mayor Curp: The more prudent thing is to just come in and say I need \$350,000.00 for 2018 to do street paving and the priorities work their way out between now and the time you have to go out to bid. The same thing with 2019, if \$500,000.00 is what you think you need, maybe the request is \$500,000.00 and we will figure out which streets need to be paved. Mayor Flaute: Well they have already figured out what the streets are. Deputy Mayor Curp: Maybe we haven't. I thought that's what our job was to establish the priorities. Certainly we like to have recommendations from staff and from our consultants that we hire to do all that sort of stuff, but in the end I think we are the ones who have to establish the priorities. Mrs. Reynolds said what \$3 million in red ink? That's not going to happen. I don't think this Council is going to approve a \$3 million in red ink budget which means even though all the departments have come in and said here is their recommendations, someone is going to have to do some priority setting and that may be us. We have asked the Manager to sit down with the staff and for them to do that amongst themselves instead of us being the bad guys.

Mr. Keaton: I'm open to whatever Council's desire is. Mrs. Reynolds: You have pick-up trucks and dump trucks, so you can just move on. Mr. Keaton: Okay, turn the page then and go down to crack sealing. Mayor Flaute: Seriously, wait a minute. Deputy Mayor Curp: Move down to the tar buggy. Mr. Keaton: You are looking at a guy that can take no as an answer. Mrs. Reynolds: Then he wanted a \$300,000.00 metal building. Mr. Keaton: Why wouldn't I want that? Mr. Denning: It's to store the pick-up trucks and dump trucks. Mrs. Reynolds: You wanted those boxes and you don't even use it. You don't even use it. Mr. Keaton: Do you think we don't? Mr. Garrett: I saw it once. Mr. Keaton: Are you talking about the black top box? It gets used quite often. It was used today and all through this week.

The pick-up trucks, I will just briefly hit on this. We have three pick-up trucks and when you look at this you are thinking this is something that the guys drive around in, but that's not the case. These are snow and ice vehicles, so they are going through the same deterioration process now as our dump trucks are going through. Years and years ago, we didn't use our pick-up trucks like this. They lasted longer. Now we are throwing salt in pick-up trucks, we are plowing snow with pick-up trucks, and we are doing de-icing procedures with pick-up trucks. What happens is we have two crews of five and I'm one of them. We have 10 guys and I throw myself in the mix, everybody gets in a dump truck where you have maximum pushing capacity and de-icing capacity on any particular shift whether it is the A shift or the B shift. When we

Thursday, November 30, 2017

overlap from 7:00-3:30 and both shifts are in it is all hands on deck. If a truck breaks down for any given reason, then we usually have three pick-up trucks set aside and they all have hoppers, salting capabilities, plows on the front of them, and they have all been set up to be de-icing vehicles. Now we have pick-up trucks that are just as much in deterioration mode as the dump trucks. We are all getting up there close to 100,000 and we are starting to see some maintenance issues starting to arise with transmission stuff and 4 wheel drive stuff because we are using that a lot. Not only is the truck hauling, but it is pushing and it is towing and it's a year round thing now. We are off road almost as much as we are on road and we are using these again as de-icing vehicles. That was the reason for the replacement of these trucks and the idea of that just to throw that out there to Council. It's not just pick-up trucks.

Mayor Flaute: You are not recommending we replace any of them this year? Mr. Keaton: No, sir. Mayor Flaute: Alright. The dump truck you are not? Mr. Keaton: No, sir. These are just things we put out there. Mrs. Lommatzsch: These are things he is asking for. Mayor Flaute: Are you asking to replace the dump trucks? Mr. Keaton: We are asking to replace these, yes. Mrs. Reynolds: They want a pick-up truck and a dump truck. Mrs. Lommatzsch: What did you think it was on the page for? Mayor Flaute: I thought he was just giving us information about our dump trucks. I asked if he was trying to replace them. Mr. Keaton: I know this isn't going to happen this year. Mayor Flaute: You know this isn't going to happen. He knows this isn't going to happen this year. Did you hear him say that?

Mr. Denning: If you replace one of these a year or if you can get in some sort of lease program similar to what the Police Department has that we can lower that cost, the initial out of pocket cost, because \$150,000.00 is a lot harder to take than \$50,000.00 or \$25,000.00 or whatever the case may be. Mr. Keaton: We looked into the lease program. People don't like to lease to you because you are going to have snow and ice equipment on it. Mr. Denning: Okay. It kind of throws that out the window. This number is not just for pick-up trucks, but they are totally equipped to be snow and ice vehicles. Mr. Denning: So \$50,000.00 includes the plow, but the plow and the stuff we have now won't fit the new truck? Mr. Keaton: I'm throwing these out there. We know this is a wish list. Mr. Denning: All I'm saying is come back to me with a real number reusing as much equipment as we can and maybe that brings this number down to \$100,000.00 for three vehicles instead of \$150,000.00. Mr. Keaton: When I gave you that number that is a real number. This is totally equipped with snow and ice equipment. Mr. Denning: Are these ½ ton or ¾ ton or 1 ton? Mr. Keaton: These are ¾ ton. Mr. Fullenkamp: So these are 250s. Mr. Denning: This is through state bid?

Mr. Keaton: When we talked we initially said this is pretty much just to put this out here. I know this isn't going to get purchased. I'm not so naïve. I'm giving you information as to what I need. I know it is not going to happen. If Council says they would like to buy some trucks this year, I can use those trucks and I can make this work with what I have. They are starting to nickel and dime us, we've got some hopper issues, we've got chains going out, and gear problems, but we are fixing stuff and keeping it alive. It is stuff that I would like to put out there on the radar for you to look at and for you to know it is coming down the pike. I'm not asking for all this stuff this coming year.

Mr. Denning: Show me some numbers that go with that. What are you maintenance costs on the existing ones? What are we going to save by buying a new one? I'm not saying we will buy you three. Mr. Keaton: I didn't know how in-depth we should go with all of this. Mr. Denning: That's information I'm asking for after the fact when you are asking for \$150,000.00. All I'm saying is if I had the information, then you can sell me. Like on the street sweeper, at least you are probably going to save \$23,000.00 or \$20,000.00 because there will still probably be some maintenance. On these three trucks, what was the average maintenance for the last two or three years and to me include your guy's time for putting the parts on because that all adds up. Mr. Keaton: I didn't go that deep because I am not so naïve to believe that this is going to happen this year and I understand that. Mr. Denning: But that's the kind of information we need. Mr. Keaton: I just want to put this out there to you. I know. Mr. Denning: What this is telling me is if I don't spend something this year, I'm going to

Thursday, November 30, 2017

be spending it later in two or three years when these trucks are going to blow up. Mr. Smith: So give him one truck. Mr. Denning: I'm okay with that too. Mr. Keaton: I'll get you the information that you want, Mike.

The next thing here is the dump truck that we were talking about. The \$160,000.00 is a dump truck that is totally equipped and again, I am not so naïve to believe that we were going to buy this. I have one Old Sterling that is yet to be replaced and the truck is 12 years old now. We spent around \$20,000.00 just in the last year and a half in maintenance costs on that particular vehicle. This is our sixth big truck in the fleet so it is used as a back-up. If something goes down, we can put them in a big truck, especially somebody that has to plow south and has to go a long way so they can have the capacity of a 5 yard bed going past 35 and be able to do their snow and ice removal duties without having to come back to the shop so much for a refill. Again, I'm throwing this out there. I'm not so naïve to think you are going to purchase this for me this coming year, but these are things out there I want Council to know about and I'm giving you some information. Mr. Smith: Does this include a snow plow? Mr. Denning: What is the next oldest? Mr. Keaton: We are getting a new truck this next week and the next oldest would be about three years old if I am not mistaken. Mr. Denning: This is the last one we would need to be replaced for 10 years. Mr. Keaton: Correct. Mr. Fullenkamp: You can use that for a couple more years.

Mr. Smith: Where is the frame at on this thing? Is it rotted? Mr. Keaton: It's getting there. You just can't stop brine and salt water. We are starting to see rust on the main frame and underneath the bed. Mr. Smith: Is it a single frame of a double frame? Mr. Keaton: It's double, but we don't have any cracking yet in this vehicle. We did nearly have to replace the whole bed in it because it was completely shot. Some of the underpinning was going really bad and it was getting very, very loose where the main hoist pushes the bed up so much so that the bed would have fallen off if you would have had it elevated and made a turn. That's the kind of condition that the underbody is in. That \$20,000.00 that we have made in repairs here was just a band-aid to keep us with an extra truck in case one breaks down. I keep one and to reiterate myself, I know we are not going to purchase this. This is just information for you all to have out there. Are there any questions on that?

A crack seal kettle is another idea that I'm throwing out there. As we move into a more aggressive paving plan, the idea is to be more active in preventative maintenance in trying to keep these roads from going to the different condition ratings as Mr. Curp talked about and be more proactive with this. Instead of paying Choice One \$2,000.00 to develop a crack seal program for us to bid it out, develop the spec books, to hold the bid, and a couple of months pass and we could have already did a whole year's worth of crack sealing by that time. The average cost of this kettle is \$50,000.00-60,000.00 outfitted with everything we would need to do our job. This would have a compressor on it to blow the cracks out so that we could get the cracks inundated with the material that needs to make its way down into the crack and the street. This would be outfitted like I said with a diesel tank as far as heating. In 2016 I believe it was American Pavements did a little over three miles of crack sealing for us and I believe it was \$26,000.00 that we paid them to do that. At the cost of the material for this which is \$.50 per pound, we could do that for nearly \$1,000.00 for that same linear footage by doing it ourselves and we could do it quicker and more aggressively if we wanted to, we could do more streets if we wanted to, and we could go where we want to go with it without having to spec it out, bid it out, and pay someone to invest money in a crack seal program that's not producing any crack sealant on the street. That's the idea behind this purchase. Again, I don't expect you to buy this this year. This is just an idea. Mr. Smith: It makes sense if it will save us money. Mayor Flaute: Maybe this is something we do need.

Mr. Fullenkamp: I'm not sure it saves money. We don't know what the labor costs are. We don't know what other jobs don't get done when you guys are out crack sealing. Again, I keep using this phrase of cost/benefit analysis. We bragged about how much we saved and we had this cooperative situation with Trotwood. What turned out was it cost us half as much, but we didn't include our labor. I can't do that comparison. This may make good sense, but what else doesn't get done when we are doing this. You guys are already claiming you are overworked. Do you want

Thursday, November 30, 2017

more work? Mr. Keaton: I can tell you this, all the work that needs to get done with me won't get done ever. I'm just being honest with you. There will never be a total accomplishment for everything we need to do. To me, you have already paid for us to be here this year. You have already paid for my men to come in next year and go to work. Let's get them the thing that they need to do their job with and put the material in and get it done. We are not going to accomplish everything we need to do.

Mr. Fullenkamp: Are you saying that you need more work for the people you have? Mr. Keaton: Absolutely not. I'm saying it's silly to pay a guy \$30.00 an hour to walk down the street picking up trash when he could be operating something that is saving the City a lot of money and his expertise could be put to use. Mr. Fullenkamp: I agree. That's also true about mowing some of these places too. I don't see anything in here about a part-time program. Mr. Keaton: I've asked for part-time programs since I have been here. We've looked for ways to get bodies in here and that's why we have the STOP program with the Police and Prisoner program. That's why I have tried Youth Works and the troubled kid situation. I've tried over the years. I have tried. Mayor Flaute: This makes some sense the way it sounds. Mr. Keaton: I will make that statement again to Council, we have so much work we won't get it done, but we will do the best we can to take bites out of the elephant in the most efficient and effective way that we can. Mayor Flaute: And this would be part of that.

Mr. Keaton: Yes, sir. There are trees to trim. There are 3,542 signs. There are 232 lane miles. There's 400 acres a mowing a week. There are oodles and oodles of trash to be picked up. There are complaints that come in from residents. There is flooding over here. There are catch basins to be fixed and pipes to be replaced. I will never be done. You should use our expertise that we have in our department to maximize what we can do, I think. Use my guys that can replace pipe under the street and let someone else pick the trash up and mow the grass. Mr. Fullenkamp: Who are those people? Mr. Keaton: That's what I need you guys to help me find and tell me. We've got experts in our field. The two guys that are retiring here coming up next March and April built three of our trailers that we use to haul our mowers around town without a scrap of material. They fabricated a truck bed to capture our chips on chip and brush. We did that out of junk steel and you can go look at it. We have got experts in the field that I have got out emptying trash cans. Let's use that expertise in a way that can benefit the City and in a much bigger way even though we are not going to get all the jobs done. I can save you using that expertise in guardrail maintenance and catch basin maintenance and street preservation where all of our money is going and that's my thought. Just a simple man just being honest. Mr. Denning: Then we can pay somebody else only \$10.00 to mow grass. Mr. Keaton: I've asked for part-timers since I have been here. Have I not? Mr. Garrett: We had them for about three years. Mr. Keaton: Give me some kids to pick trash up and empty trash cans. I will take them all day long and let my guys do that stuff that needs to be done.

The metal equipment building, here we go. I know we are not going to get this this year, but here is an idea for you. The idea with this building because Council has been so gracious and has given us so much help and the equipment you have really invested a lot in us and we do appreciate that so very much, but it has to sit outside. I'm not aware of any plan to move us real soon, so why not maximize every square inch I can get on that property to put stuff in to keep it out of the weather? I'm having problems with the trucks as far as snow and ice removal goes. Imagine we get a call in, I call you and it is 2:00 a.m. We don't have anywhere to put our trucks, so Bill gets the call and he comes in and is all ready to go. He comes out and looks and his truck has got 6 inches of snow on it. You can't put any salt in that truck, Bill, because if you do it is going to freeze up and you are going to have to take the backhoe and dig the salt out of the back and it forms like concrete. It would take you several hours to do that. Here's Bill over here trying to start his truck and his truck won't start because it is so cold and even though you've got it plugged in, the block heater is not producing enough heat to start the big diesel motor. Bill has to set there and wait and calls Jay on the phone and Jay has to leave his snow removal route to come in and help Bill get his truck started. We finally get Bill's truck started and everybody else is having the same problem too. Now we have to wait about an hour to an hour and a half to

Thursday, November 30, 2017

get that truck to thaw out enough to be driven and enough to get the thing de-iced even before we can load it up with salt. We need somewhere to keep this stuff. I've got three guys on that five man crew that have to set and wait because they had to keep stuff outside. These are \$160,000.00 trucks. I would recommend spending the cost of two trucks to house every truck we've got and give us the efficiency that when we pull up we don't have to do that. Make them high enough in there where we can get portable lifts and crank these things up and work on them a little bit. If in the future the City wants to get a mechanic, which is so badly needed, they would have a place to work.

Mayor Flaute: This \$300,000.00, is that a number you have checked out as far as getting a metal building? Mr. Keaton: Yes, sir. Mayor Flaute: Is there room on the property to put these? Mr. Keaton: I had a contractor come out and we measured the property and the turn radius to come in and around the salt building. This would go from the gas tanks, stretch all the way towards the school, and it would take a left and we would move the shed out of the way to the other side of the lot and butt up against our salt dome. That would take up every square inch where we park currently already; we just don't have cover there. We are very ugly back there, the school doesn't like us. This would improve the aesthetics of that situation tremendously and it would not only get the trucks out, but I believe we would have enough space in these things to get nearly every piece of equipment I have stored outside under roof to protect that gracious investment that you all gave us. Again, I don't expect you all to purchase this this year, but something that I will keep out there for you guys to think about. Mr. Denning: You could fit your crack seal kettle in there? Mr. Keaton: The crack seal kettle and the black top box that we never use and all kinds of stuff.

Mayor Flaute: It looks like the crack seal might be something. Mr. Smith: It sounds like that metal building is something we need. Mrs. Lommatzsch: It's investing and protecting what we buy. Mr. Keaton: This is a tough position you all are in. It's not easy being you people and I do appreciate everything you all do. Deputy Mayor Curp: Does it have to be metal? Mr. Keaton: It doesn't have to be. Deputy Mayor Curp: You've got the canvas canopy over the salt bin. Mr. Keaton: It doesn't have to be metal. We were just thinking something a little more long term. Mayor Flaute: Won't those canvas things last a long time? Mr. Keaton: I don't know. We get some super high winds coming through there and you are talking about the canvas. Mr. Smith: And the UV rays from the sun. Mr. Denning: You might spend a little less, but you are eventually going to have to replace all of that anyway. Mr. Keaton: I do appreciate you all. I'm stepping into this and I'm trying to help out the best that I can. Deputy Mayor Curp: You did fine. Now the City Manager doesn't have any time, so we are good. Jay, you did a good job.

There were no additional questions or comments.

Mayor Flaute: It is 9:42. Do we want to continue on? Mr. Smith: I've got 15 more minutes for you. Deputy Mayor Curp: I suggest doing these others at the next Council meeting and go into our Executive Session. Mayor Flaute: Is that alright with everybody?

E) 2018 Budget – Administration Department

This agenda item was moved to the December 7, 2017 Council meeting.

F) 2018 Budget – Finance Department

This agenda item was moved to the December 7, 2017 Council meeting.

## **ITEM 8: UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

### **A) RESOLUTIONS**

- I) Resolution No. 17-R-2320 authorizing the City Manager to sign a Memorandum of Understanding**

Thursday, November 30, 2017

**(MOU) with Mad River Local Schools for the Stebbins Student Revitalization Program.**

Mr. Carpenter withdrew Resolution No. 17-R-2320 to provide time for review of updated documentation.

**ITEM 9: EXECUTIVE SESSION**

- A) **Personnel Matter – Section 103.01(d)(1):** *Unless the City employee or official requests a public hearing; to consider the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion or compensation of a city employee or official or the investigation of charges or complaints against a City employee or official.*
  
- B) **Legal Matters – Section 103.01(d)(3):** *Conferences with any attorney representing the City as counsel concerning disputes involving the City, its Council, boards, commissions, officials, and employees that are subject of pending or imminent court action or discussion of any matters where are properly covered under the attorney-client privilege as recognized by the law of Ohio.*

A motion was made by Mrs. Reynolds to enter into executive session for the reasons stated on the agenda. Deputy Mayor Curp seconded the motion.

There was no further discussion on the motion.

A roll call vote was as follows: Mrs. Reynolds, yes; Deputy Mayor Curp, yes; Mr. Denning, yes; Mr. Fullenkamp, yes; Mrs. Lommatzsch, yes; Mr. Smith, yes; and Mayor Flaute, yes. **Motion carried.**

Council entered at 9:43 p.m. and came out of Executive Session at 10:45 p.m.

**ITEM 10: ADJOURNMENT**

Motion to adjourn was made by Mr. Denning. Mrs. Reynolds seconded the motion.

There was no discussion on the motion.

Roll call: Mr. Denning; yes; Mrs. Reynolds, yes; Deputy Mayor Curp, yes; Mr. Fullenkamp; yes; Mrs. Lommatzsch, yes; Mr. Smith, yes; and Mayor Flaute: yes. **Motion carried.**

The meeting adjourned at 10:45 p.m.

---

William R. Flaute, Mayor

---

Brenna Arnold, Clerk of Council